

**MINUTES  
MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
CLIFTON TOWN MEETING  
DECEMBER 3, 2007**

**MEETING CALLED TO ORDER:**

The regular meeting of the Board of Trustees of Clifton Town Meeting was called to order on December 3, 2007, at the Clifton Recreation Center, 320 McAlpin Avenue, Cincinnati, Ohio, at 7:25 pm. The meeting was chaired by President Druffel.

*Reporter's Note: Voting for CTM Trustees took place between 7:00pm and 7:30pm.*

**TRUSTEES PRESENT:**

The following Trustees were present for the meeting: John Berten, George Bishop, Jack Bourgoin, Dick Druffel, Gary Eby, Mike Elovitz, Bill Gordon, Linda Goldenhar, Forrest Griffen, David Kieft, Robin Lee, Malcolm Montgomery, Mary Schubauer-Berigan, Steve Slack and Brad Thomas.

The presence of a quorum is duly noted.

**REVIEW OF MINUTES OF LAST MEETING**

A draft version of the minutes of the November, 2007, meeting had been previously circulated to the Board for review and comment. Upon motion made by Trustee Eby, seconded by Trustee Thomas, the minutes of the November 5, 2007, meeting were unanimously approved.

**TREASURER'S REPORT**

The Treasurer's report for November, 2007, had been previously circulated to the Board for review and comment. Treasurer Gordon gave a presentation concerning the Treasurer's report and answered questions from Board members and members of the Clifton community in the audience. A discussion ensued concerning the income and expenditures of the Streets Scape event. Upon motion made by Trustee Kieft, seconded by Trustee Thomas, the November, 2007, Treasurer's report was unanimously approved, with Trustee Gordon abstaining.

**REGULAR REPORTS**

Fire Department Report

No report this meeting.

## Recreation Center Report

- Seniors will be taking a holiday trip to Pyramid Hill on December 13th;
- Rec Center will be sponsoring Family Fun Nights on Wednesdays during November and December for parents and kids. No membership fee is required for these events;
- Basketball league is forming, contact Rec Center for details;
- There will be a winter mini-camp from December 24, 2007, through January 4, 2008 for kids between the ages of 5 and 12;
- Sign up for 2008 potter classes is now taking place.

President Druffel noted the retirement of Dale Doerman from the recreation center on December 1, 2007. President Druffel read the following resolution thanking Mr. Doerman for his service to the Clifton community:

*Clifton Town Meeting wants to express it's heartfelt thanks to our beloved Recreation Center Director, Dale Doerman, for all his help and positive energy in his service to the City, the Clifton Recreation Center and the Community. We will miss his help and leadership in the Clifton Recreation Center. Thank you, Dale.*

The resolution was adopted unanimously by the Board. President Druffel announced that as a token of the community's appreciation for Mr. Doerman's service that CTM would provide him gift certificates to Clifton merchants.

## Police Report (Officer Williams and Captain Bailey)

Cincinnati Police Officer Governor Williams presented the police report. A report showing November, 2007, crime statistics for Clifton and nearby areas was made available for distribution. Officer Williams was joined by District 5 Captain Bailey.

Officer Williams reported that crimes of theft are up, which is typical during the holiday season. He stated that this issue is being addressed, in part, by additional plain clothes officers in the Clifton business district.

Officer Williams reported that District 5, with the help of volunteers, has placed door hangers on various residences in Clifton giving crime safety tips. This was particularly directed to reduce the number of burglaries in the area.

Officer Williams reported on the bank robbery at the U.S. Bank on Ludlow Avenue. He stated that the police have a suspect and are attempting to apprehend him.

Trustee Bishop thanked District 5 for its help in the Light Up Clifton campaign. Trustee Bishop also encouraged more members of the Clifton community to volunteer for Citizens on Patrol.

Captain Bailey discussed the issue of copper theft. He stated that District 5 was in the process of developing a program to address this growing problem. Captain Bailey noted that there were already laws in place regulating scrap dealers. Directing enforcement of these laws may help in lessening the problem.

Trustee Elovitz noted that “dawn to dusk” devices for porch lights are available at home improvement stores. Care should be taken to select the proper device for the type of light bulb used.

Officer Williams and Captain Bailey answered several questions posed by Board members and community members in the audience.

### **CTM COMMITTEE REPORTS**

#### **Parks and Recreation Committee - Trustee Slack**

Trustee Slack gave a presentation concerning the potential impact on Mt. Storm Park of the planned widening of Interstate 75. Trustee Slack has had discussions with representatives of the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT).

Trustee Slack noted that the hillside leading up from Interstate 75 into the park contains the finest native plant area remaining in Clifton. While plans for the interstate have not been finalized, preliminary plans call for the removal of the “toe” of the hillside. There is still an outstanding issue whether a retaining wall would be built.

Trustee Slack noted that in any event, new plantings and grass, which would be installed at the base of the hill as part of the construction, would require maintenance, and that currently the Park Board has no budget for this maintenance.

Trustee Slack stated that if desired, he could make arrangements for representatives of ODOT and the Park Board to attend a future CTM meeting.

Various members of the Board and members of the Clifton community in the audience made comments concerning the impact of the highway construction on Mt. Storm Park.

#### **Special Agenda Item - Mechanical Reindeer**

Community member Kip Eagen addressed the Board concerning a plan to install 16 to 18 mechanical reindeer on the roof of the Clifton Branch Library during the holiday season, at the corner of Ludlow and Ormond. The library will be sponsoring an essay writing contest for young children, teens, and adults, to explain how the reindeer came to be on the roof. Gift certificate prizes to local merchants will be awarded to the best essays in the various categories.

Mr. Eagen requested that CTM contribute \$175 toward the purchase of the gift certificates. Local merchants have agreed to match contributions.

President Druffel noted that this item was not in the CTM budget, and that in the future he was unsure whether CTM could support these types of non budgeted activities without additional fund raising. President Druffel stated he could support an expenditure for this item for 2007 only.

Upon motion made by President Druffel, seconded by Trustee Thomas, it was moved that CTM donate \$175 to this activity per the request of Mr. Eagen. The motion was approved unanimously by the Board.

#### Housing and Zoning Committee -Trustee Montgomery

- Proposed cell phone tower

Trustee Montgomery introduced Mr. Kit Nickel, a representative of T-Mobile. Mr. Nickel made a presentation to the Trustees concerning a proposed cell phone antenna to be located on top of Lafayette Hall, 500 Lafayette Avenue.

Mr. Nickel explained that he was making this presentation to CTM at the request of the owners of Lafayette Hall (the Deaconess Association/ Scarlet Oaks). He stated that the owners of Lafayette Hall did not wish to engage in discussions with T-Mobile about the project unless there was some assurance that the Clifton community would not oppose the plan.

Mr. Nickel explained the need for a cell phone antenna in the general area of north Clifton, and the rationale for selecting a site on top of Mt. Storm. He stated that placing the antenna on top of Mt. Storm would eliminate the need to construct a more intrusive "tower" at some other location. Mr. Nickel stated that placing the cell phone antenna on top of an existing structure would be the most aesthetically pleasing method, because the antenna could be concealed.

Mr. Nickel explained his firm's experience in selecting cell phone antenna sites, and his prior work in Wilmington, Ohio, which in his opinion has a historic district somewhat similar to Clifton.

Mr. Nickel gave general examples of how a cell antenna on top of Lafayette Hall could be concealed with architectural elements. He stated that T-Mobile would be willing to work with CTM's Housing and Zoning Committee and architect Guy Humphry to come up with an appropriate design.

Mr. Humphry addressed the Board and stated that if a cell phone antenna is to be constructed that the type of plan presented by T-Mobile is the best alternative. Trustee Montgomery also addressed the Board and stated his concurrence with Mr. Humphry.

Mr. Nickel answered several questions which were raised by Board members and members of the Clifton community. One issue was whether other service providers could also place their antenna on Lafayette Hall and how this might affect the ultimate design of whatever structure would be placed on the roof of Lafayette Hall. Mr. Nickel stated that T-Mobile would be willing to consider this issue.

In response to questions Mr. Nickel stated that erection of the antenna on Lafayette Hall would not require a zoning change, but would be reviewed under the City's Building Code. Mr. Nickel stated that while the FCC requires service providers to provide adequate coverage, the federal government would not force Clifton to accept a cell phone tower or antenna.

In response to questions concerning electro-magnetic fields, Mr. Nickel stated that the cell phone antenna would emit an electro-magnetic field. He stated that the proposed antenna was 1000 Watts, which in his opinion was minimal. He stated that in his opinion there is no evidence that electro-magnetic fields are harmful.

In response to specific questions from Trustee Eby, Mr. Nickel stated that the current proposal was limited to Lafayette Hall, and did not include any other structures in the adjacent Deaconess/Scarlet Oaks complex.

Mr. Nickel stated that the project was in its initial stages and that CTM would be involved in the process before any final decisions were made.

Trustee Montgomery moved, with a second, the following motion:

*If there is to be a new cellular antenna in North Clifton, Clifton Town Meeting would prefer that it be located within an architecturally appropriate addition to the existing structure at 500 Lafayette Avenue, provided that CTM remains involved in the process at every point of decision.*

Trustee Schubauer-Berigan suggested a friendly amendment to the motion which would specifically state that the proposed T-Mobile cell phone antenna on the roof of Lafayette Hall, with concealment, should be designed in such a way as to accommodate future placement of cell phone antennae by other service providers. Trustee Montgomery rejected the friendly amendment.

Upon rejection of the friendly amendment, the question was called, and the motion passed with 8 Trustees in favor, 5 opposed, and 2 abstentions.

President Druffel stated that he would communicate directly with the owner of Lafayette Hall to advise them of the actions taken by the Board.

## City Budget Items (Trustee Eby)

### -Gaslight Street Assessment

Trustee Eby made a presentation to the Board and members of the Clifton community in attendance concerning an line item in the City Manager's 2008 City Budget Proposal to levy a \$4.00 per foot of frontage on property owners on gas light streets. Trustee Eby announced that since the time that this matter was originally placed on the agenda for this meeting the Mayor had removed this proposal from the Budget recommendations submitted to City Council. Trustee Eby stated that it was still possible that City Council might reinstate the gas light street assessment in the final approved budget.

Trustee Eby displayed a listing of Clifton streets with gaslight streets highlighted. He also showed several maps of Clifton highlighting the location of gas light streets.

Several members of the Clifton community in attendance spoke against the imposition of the gas light street assessment. No one spoke in favor of the assessment.

Upon motion made by Trustee Eby, seconded by Trustee Thomas, it was resolved as follows:

***WHEREAS, Clifton Town Meeting (CTM) is the recognized Community Council for the community of Clifton; and***

***WHEREAS, the City Manager of the City of Cincinnati in his 2008 budget proposal recommended that the City levy an assessment of \$4.00 per foot of frontage on gas light streets in the City; and***

***WHEREAS, the Mayor of the City of Cincinnati has removed the gas light street assessment from the budget he has submitted to City Council;***

***IT IS HEREBY RESOLVED THAT:***

*The Board of Trustees of Clifton Town Meeting is opposed to the levy of a gas light street assessment as set forth in the City Manager's proposed 2008 budget; and*

*The President of Clifton Town Meeting is authorized to communicate to the Mayor and to members of City Council CTM's opposition to this item and its support of the Mayor's decision not to seek a gas light street assessment.*

*So resolved: December 3, 2007.*

The resolution was adopted unanimously by the Board.

-NSP Funding

Trustee Eby also reported that the City Manager had proposed to reduce the amount of the City's funding of Community Councils (NSP grants) from \$7,000 to \$5,000. President Druffel reported that the Mayor had also removed this proposal from the Budget, and instead has proposed an increase in NSP funding from \$7,000 to \$8,000.

Upon motion made by Trustee Eby, seconded by Trustee Druffel, is was resolved as follows:

***WHEREAS, Clifton Town Meeting (CTM) is the recognized Community Council for the community of Clifton; and***

***WHEREAS, the City Manager of the City of Cincinnati in his 2008 budget proposal recommended that the City reduce its funding levels for community councils (NSP grant) from \$7,000 to \$5,000; and***

***WHEREAS, the Mayor of the City of Cincinnati has removed the NSP funding reductions from the budget he has submitted to City Council;***

***IT IS HEREBY RESOLVED THAT:***

***The Board of Trustees of Clifton Town Meeting is opposed to the NSP funding reductions as set forth in the City Manager's proposed 2008 budget; and***

***The President of Clifton Town Meeting is authorized to communicate to the Mayor and to members of City Council CTM's opposition to this item and its support of the Mayor's proposed budget to increase NSP funding to \$8,000.00.***

***So resolved: December 3, 2007.***

No one spoke against the motion. The motion was unanimously adopted by the Board.

**Nomination and Election Committee (Trustee Schubauer-Berigan)**

Betsy Black, election volunteer, announced the results of the CTM Trustee election, which had been conducted prior to the start of the meeting, between 7:00-7:30pm.

The following 7 candidates were elected to fill a three year term expiring in 2010; Ron Becker, George Bishop, Jack Bourgojn, Mike Elovitz, Bill Fant, David Kieft and Steve Slack.

The following 2 candidates were elected to fill a two year unexpired term, expiring in 2009; Steven Keller and Al McLaughlin

The newly elected Trustees' term of office will commence on January 1, 2008.

Trustee Schubauer-Berigan announced that candidate Jan Toraason had withdrawn her candidacy, and therefore the one year unexpired term, expiring in 2008, remains unfilled.

There being no objections raised to the election results, President Druffel welcomed the newly elected Trustees to the Board.

### Outgoing Trustees

The Board acknowledged the community service of the following outgoing Trustees; Carol Brammer, Dan Deering, Forrest Griffen, Jerry Ransohoff and Beth Withers. Trustee Slack personally thanked Trustee Griffen, who was present at the meeting, for his work with the Parks Committee.

### Clifton Gaslight Main Street Program

Trustee Kieft reported that 28 lamp posts in the Ludlow business district had been decorated for the holiday season. Volunteers were thanked for their efforts.

Trustee Schubauer-Berigan reported that Main Street volunteers have been surveying shoppers on the Ludlow business district. She noted that a copy of the survey is included in the recent issue of the Clifton Chronicle. She encouraged Cliftonites to complete the survey and return it. Trustee Schubauer-Berigan also noted that volunteers are needed for additional field surveying.

### Ludlow Revitalization Project

Community member Phil Herrick gave an update on the planned demolition of the Bender Optical Building, 333 Ludlow Avenue. Although the demotion of the Bender Optical Building has been scheduled for some time, at the last minute the demolition contractor was advised by the City that a demolition permit cannot be issued on this property, pursuant to City regulations, until there is a public hearing on the issuance of the permit. This will delay the project until the hearing can be held. Mr. Herrick stated that he would advise the CTM President when the notice of hearing is issued.

### Other Business

It was announced that the Winter Carriage Rides will not take place this year. A brief discussion ensued between Trustee Schubauer-Berigan and Trustee Berten concerning the reasons why this event will not take place.

President Druffel expressed his thanks to the Safety Committee, and the volunteers which assisted them, for the success of the Light Up Clifton campaign.

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

- The January 7, 2008, CTM meeting will be held at the Clifton Recreation Center at 7:00pm.
- Current Trustees and newly elected Trustees will have a strategy session on December 8, 2007, at the Trailside Nature Center in Burnet Woods.

There being no further business before the Board, upon motion made by Trustee Thomas, seconded by Trustee Kieft, the meeting was adjourned upon unanimous consent at 9:15 pm.

Respectfully submitted: Gary Eby, Secretary