



**CTM Meeting Minutes**  
**January 7, 2013**  
**Clifton Recreation Center**

In attendance: Ben Pantoja, Eric Urbas, Kevin Marsh, Buddy Goose, Ashley Fritz, Adam Balz, Linda Ash, Morgan Rich, Joyce Rich, Tom Dwyer, Pat Knapp

Absent: Tony Sizemore, Bruce Bernard, Michael Moran, Brian Curwin

**Election of 2013 Officers**

The 2013 CTM Officers were approved unanimously.

President	Ben Pantoja
Vice Presidents	Buddy Goose and Michael Moran
Treasurer	Tom Dwyer
Secretary	Pat Knapp

**Committee Chairs**

2013 CTM Committee Chairs were approved unanimously.

Nominating Committee	Kevin Marsh
Events Committee	Linda Ash, Joyce Rich, Tony Sizemore
Beautification Committee	Adam Balz
Communications Committee	
--Membership/Listserve/Website	Brian Curwin
--Clifton Chronicle	TBD
Housing & Zoning Committee	Michael Moran
Boundaries Committee	N/A
Bylaws Committee	N/A
Green Committee	Bruce Bernard
Business District Committee	Morgan Rich

**CTM Liaisons with Outside Groups**

2013 CTM Liaisons were approved unanimously.

Plaza LLC	Tom Dwyer and Buddy Goose
CBPA	Buddy Goose and need a second person, TBD
NSP	Tom Dwyer and Ben Pantoja
Neighborhoods of Uptown	Ben Pantoja and Michael Moran
Parks Department	Michael Moran

Uptown Consortium	Buddy Goose, Morgan Rich
TriHealth	Bruce Bernard
Clifton Community Fund	TBD
CCAC	N/A

I-75	N/A (Housing & Zoning Committee will keep us informed)
Public Safety	TBD (Malcolm Montgomery attends meetings)
A/V	Malcolm Montgomery (trainee needed)

### **Conflict of Interest**

Trustees were presented with CTM's Conflict of Interest policy. Trustees are required to sign COI forms to attest they will avoid any conflicts between the interests of CTM/the Clifton community and their own personal, professional, and business interests. Attending trustees completed and submitted the forms.

### **Approval of Minutes**

Minutes from the December 2012 CTM meeting were approved with abstentions from new trustees.

### **Regular Reports**

#### **Police Report**

Officer Lisa Johnson shared a flyer encouraging residents to keep on the lookout for drug dealing in the neighborhood and to report suspicious activity to police. Officer Johnson also provided a profile on a man suspected of burglaries in the area. The 6'1", 185-pound black man has allegedly been breaking into homes. Officer Johnson also noted that a juvenile was recently caught inside a home when an alert neighbor phoned in the crime, and she encouraged others to be alert and to call police when they see suspicious activity.

Officer Johnson reported again on the use of deer cameras to record criminal activity. The cameras have been particularly successful at capturing images of graffiti taggers. A case in court last week resulted in a conviction, \$4,000 in restitution, and a sentence of 60 days in jail for the tagger. Images from the deer camera were key to the success of the case.

Officer Johnson is requesting CTM purchase three additional deer cameras. The cameras are \$160 each and with the addition of security boxes, locks, memory cards, and charging stations, each camera totals approximately \$200.

An audience member (Carolyn Miller) asked how long Cincinnati PD has been using the cameras and if they have been deterrents to crime. Officer Johnson responded that they have been used in Northside and other neighborhoods for illegal garbage dumping problems and have been successful. In Clifton, they have been used mostly for graffiti. The cameras are useful because they are motion-sensitive and also can be easily moved from location to location. They have also been used to catch thieves breaking into cars because the cameras were pointed in that direction.

### **Recreation Center**

Rec Center Director Tom Reese reported that the planned renovation of the center is on hold until the City's 2013 budget is approved. The center is slated to close in August 2013 for 9 months during the renovation.

During the renovation, the Rec Center will continue before and after-school services with Fairview. Some of the classes may be held in the basement of the CCAC.

The Rec Center is featuring new classes including circus-skills classes taught by My Nose Turns Red and a new Zumba Golden class, a slower-paced version of the typical Zumba class.

### **Fire Department**

No report was provided.

### **Special CTM Reports**

#### Clifton Business District Development Support

Kathleen Norris of Urban Fast Forward gave a presentation on the challenges of creating and sustaining a good neighborhood retail district. Norris is the consultant who helped create the Gateway Quarter in Over the Rhine, worked with the Uptown Consortium on Short Vine, and also worked on Cincinnati Restaurant Row and tenant improvements for the new Queen City Square.

Norris noted that Clifton has always been one of our best neighborhoods in the city and has had one of the most vibrant business districts. Because we're seeing the revitalization of other nearby neighborhoods such as OTR, Northside, and Corryville, that creates competition for Ludlow Avenue.

She noted that a vibrant neighborhood retail district needs three things: a vision, a plan, and a to-do list.

The general challenges of urban retail districts include:

- vacancy rates (although Ludlow has a relatively low vacancy rate)
- footprints (building size; Ludlow's are relatively small)
- poor identity (unsafe/unclean, traffic/parking, merchant mix). She noted Ludlow could stand improvement in our visuals and noted that you need parking even in a nice walkable retail district like Ludlow
- merchant mix (should be deliberate, not accidental). She noted that over time retail districts can lose cohesiveness and a sense of destination and appeal if they are not proactively planned.
- uninteresting. Especially in this "Experience Economy," she noted, people will go where they can have a pleasant experience.
- unplanned

Norris emphasized that to develop an effective retail district plan, property owners, other businesses, residents, and customers must all be engaged in the process. Retail districts must proactively recruit tenants, grow local entrepreneurs, and “choose authenticity over perfection,” that is, preserve the unique sense of the neighborhood. To recruit quality tenants, districts need to know what they have to offer (ideal are attractive sites, facades, footprints, fittings, desirable co-tenants, competitive rents, tenant improvement allowances, and marketing).

When vacancies occur, it’s best to be ready with a plan for who should fill the spot, rather than leaving it to chance. The reopening of the grocery store, she noted, provides a unique opportunity to jumpstart the business district.

Audience members (Carolyn Miller) asked what Norris’ role would be. In other neighborhoods, Norris said, she has worked with leadership to develop a vision and action plan, and has also worked directly with landlords. Sometimes she offers leasing services to the landlords.

Pat Knapp asked how she would work with existing landlords and tenants. Norris responded that in Clifton, the challenge would be to plan for vacancies over a three-year period, focusing on strengthening the business district over time. If we had a vacancy, what would the ideal replacement be to enliven the streetfront, add cohesion to the district, and bring customers.

Malcolm Montgomery asked if there is a tie-in with Form-Based Codes. Norris responded that form-based codes are a return to the planning principals we abandoned in the 1950s as we began planning for automobiles. Before then, we had thriving neighborhood business districts. Clifton is in many ways an existing form-based neighborhood; “you have intact what a lot of other neighborhoods are trying to reinstall.”

Beth Robinson of Uptown Consortium said they employed Norris to do a leasing plan for Short Vine and she also did some brokerage work for them. “She set the tone for the revitalization we’re now experiencing over there.” Robinson noted that Uptown Consortium is willing to contribute part of the cost of developing a retail district plan. They have already met with some key Ludlow Avenue property owners to discuss the possibility of such a plan, and they propose a partnership between CTM, CPBA, Uptown Consortium, and Clifton 20/20, with funding coming from CTM, CPBA, and Uptown.

Ben Pantoja noted that from his perspective, for CTM to commit money to the process, CPBA would have to be equally involved financially. CTM would also have to have separate discussions with 3CDC, Uptown, and other clients of Norris’ about their impressions of the process and any “watchouts.” And CTM would need to benchmark with other community councils who have healthy business districts, such as Hyde Park, to identify best practices. He noted we should also “start small,” minimizing the initial commitment of dollars and figuring out the “best bang for our buck.” Also, he would need assurance that the process would include representation and engagement from the

neighborhood's varied constituents (age, ethnicity, race, owners vs. renters, college students, etc.).

Kevin Marsh noted that he supports the approach because of the high turnover rate on Ludlow and the idea of proactively planning the tenant mix on the street. Having an expert laser-focused on preparing for turnover would benefit the neighborhood.

Other trustees voiced their support for the idea of a retail district plan, but need more information. Tom Dwyer noted that in a year when we are showing a budget deficit, spending a large chunk of money is problematic for him.

Pantoja moved that the Business District Committee begin looking into a plan. The motion carried. Pantoja noted that if we can get a cost estimate for the work, it can be added to the 2013 budget later.

### **2013 Budget**

#### **Tom, please check all numbers**

Tom Dwyer presented a year-end financial statement for 2012 showing revenues of \$58,584 (primarily from the Clifton House Tour) and expenses of \$52,933, resulting in \$5,650 net cash available for the year. CTM's total cash position as of December 31, 2012, is \$87,908.

The 2012 financial statement was approved; Tom Dwyer abstained.

Dwyer presented a proposed 2013 budget showing a deficit of \$8,540. Revenues are projected at \$33,400. Projected revenues for 2013 include \$14,000 in Chronicle advertising, \$7,500 in membership dues, \$6,000 annual funding from TriHealth, and \$5,700 for NSP funding). He noted we will need to get out another membership letter to increase revenues in that category, and we may want to consider other fundraisers to increase revenues.

Major expenses include \$1,625 for new Clifton signs; \$2,634 for beautification, \$3,257 for the Vine/Woolper project; \$3,688 for Chronicle postage; \$3,700 for the Chronicle publisher; and \$3,856 for Chronicle printing. The budget also includes \$6200 for Cliftonfest and Streetscapes; \$1,500 for Holidays on Ludlow carriages; \$700 for the annual Lantern Walk; \$1,300 for the Memorial Day Parade; \$2,500 for website improvements, specifically to add an e-commerce function; \$1,200 for membership development, and \$1,000 for insurance. With the Rec Center closing in August, expenses to conduct CTM meetings are an unknown at this time.

The budget includes \$5,000 for LLC expenses. A discussion ensued about CTM's responsibilities for the LLC. The consensus was that CTM agreed to cover capital improvements for the plaza but not maintenance costs. The agreement between CTM and CBPA is not clear and needs to be reviewed. It is also not clear who pays property taxes on the plaza. Linda Ash proposed deleting the money from the budget until the agreement is reviewed, but Dwyer noted that it needs to stay in because of commitments made

toward capital improvements. Malcolm Montgomery noted that including money in the budget doesn't lock us in for the year. If there are no concrete plans for capital improvements, it can be taken out of the budget.

Ben Pantoja moved to approve the budget with the addition of \$1,000 for CTM meeting rentals and \$600 for three deer cameras. He also proposed changing the LLC line item to note "LLC Capital Improvements." This would increase the 2013 deficit. Pantoja noted that with our current cash position, we can absorb the deficit. Dwyer suggested we consider another fundraiser or cut back on expenses.

The 2013 budget as appended was approved; Dwyer abstained.

### **Community Q&A**

Daniel Ames noted we might want to check with US Bank about temporary meeting space while the Rec Center is closed.

Betsy Black suggested we check with local churches. She also liked Tom Dwyer's suggestion for a Clifton Shredding Day.

### **Next Meeting**

Monday, February 4, 2013, 7 p.m., Clifton Rec Center