

CTM Meeting Minutes
July 6, 2015
Clifton Cultural Arts Center

Present: Adam Balz, Morgan Rich, Kevin Marsh, Michael Moran, Tony Sizemore, Ben Pantoja, Eric Urbas, Adam Hyland, Nicholas Hollan, Rama Kasturi, Mike Schur, Shaun McCance

Absent: Ashley Fritz, Joyce Rich, Pat Knapp

A quorum is present. Meeting called to order at 7:05pm

Police Report

Neighborhood Liaison Officer Nick Hageman shared STARS report. Total violent crimes are down 60% in Clifton in the past 12 months. About a 3% downturn in total crimes over the past 12 months.

Jefferson Avenue will be congested / closed during August for two different water slide events coming up.

Noted an incredible turnout for passing PO Sonny Kim's funeral. He will be dearly missed.

Speed cart will be deployed in early July in Clifton using one of the locations the community has suggested.

Officer Hageman can be reached at 513.569.8527; email is nicholas.hageman@cincinnati-oh.gov. See the Clifton Community website for other police contact info on the Public Safety page.

Fire Report

Firefighter Leslie Light from Engine 34 reported. 112 EMS runs. 26 fire responses, but all very minor events. Noted strong support for the fire department from the community.

Captain James Kettler from Engine 34 can be reached at 513.352.2334; email is james.kettler@cincinnati-oh.gov; or visit the fire station on Ludlow Avenue.

Library Report

No library report was provided.

Recreation Center

Service Area Manager Tom Reese reported that pickle ball is catching on at Clifton. Tues/Thur evening. Priority registration for pre/post school programs starts July 13. Will take 90 students.

CCAC

CCAC Board member Fran Larkin reported. Wednesdays on the Green continues – Every Child Succeeds in the July partner for charitable contributions of items.

Golden Ticket Artist Showcase deadline for artists has been extended.

Summer camps continue include puppets, art academy, scrap art, and “My Nose Turns Red”. See their website for more details. www.cliftonculturalarts.org

CBPA

No report was provided.

Minutes of the June CTM meeting were approved as presented.

Friends of Findlay Market

John Kornbluh of Friends of Findlay Market (FFM) made a presentation about Findlay Market. He recalled that he used to shop at Findlay Market and then would come to Keller’s IGA to get his other needs. Market has been around for 150 years.

Findlay Market visitor count has doubled since 2005. One of the top 5 places in Cincinnati that people visit. People come for entertainment, music, book signings, Essentially Findlay Market acts as a “town square”.

Open 7 days a week. All things sold at the farmers’ market section are produced or grown by the people that are doing the selling.

Findlay Market has community outreach programs for selling food in neighborhoods and the SNAP Plus program. They are also about to start construction on “The Kitchen” which is a cooking area for which small businesses can use to get started. Approx opening date unknown, but could be end of this year. Findlay Market is also working to compost all available items.

Please review the website www.findlaymarket.org for more information.

Slide presentation will be included as an addendum to the meeting minutes.

Clifton Fest 2015

Pete Schneider of Clifton Fest LLC presented a status for the upcoming event in September 25, 26, & 27. This year will be the 4th year of the event. There will be a few changes to the event.

2014 Summary – approx 11000 attendees, 28% increase over 2013. 46 vendors, 82% were return vendors from prior year. Broad range of music, yoga, 5K, meditation, kids things, art carpets and street performances. Feedback was consistently positive. Also, feedback indicated a desire for more “street food” and a second beer outlet at the main stage.

Updates for the 2015 event:

Overall “look and feel” to remain unchanged.

Shorter duration on Ludlow Ave – Friday night kickoff, and street closure just on Saturday. Diggs/Clifton Plaza programming will remain 2 full days. 5K will continue to be on Sunday. Single stage – located across Ludlow at Ormond. Smaller footprint. Art carpets not scheduled for this year due to departure of art coordinator. Expected to return in a different format in 2016.

Sponsorship opportunities broadened due to city-wide reach of the event. Budget is \$32,425 expenses for this year’s reduced event. The 2014 event was around \$40,000 expenses. The event does turn a net profit. 2014 profit was about \$14k. 2015 profit is expected to be \$5k, and this allows early planning and commitments to be made for the next year. Core neighborhood groups (including CTM, CBPA, Uptown Consortium) contributed 55% of the total funding.

Slide presentation will be included as an addendum to the meeting minutes.

CTM Relationship with Ludlow 21 Working Group

Ben Pantoja reported on the relationship of CTM with Ludlow 21 Working Group. Ben wants to clarify and define the relationship due to two concerns:

1. Ludlow 21 lobbying of City Hall can be misconstrued as having CTM’s support.
2. Conflict of goals regarding grocery store at 319 Ludlow Avenue.

Ben made a motion to eliminate any appearance that CTM is formally connected to Ludlow 21:

Allow CTM support for specific Ludlow 21 efforts, but eliminate any appearance that CTM is formally connected to Ludlow 21:

1. CTM is to no longer have official “representatives” on Ludlow 21. Trustees can volunteer for Ludlow 21, but they do so as individuals.
2. CTM is to avoid any written communication that could create the appearance that the organizations are linked such as “CTM wants your feedback on these logos sent to Ludlow 21”. CTM could still announce Ludlow 21 events but must word these announcements as if they were publicizing a meeting for a separate organization.
3. Ludlow 21 is to cease referring to CTM as participating in its organization, including references to “collaboration” with CTM or to being a “Working Group” that includes CTM.
4. CTM may still choose to promote or fund Ludlow 21 events and other projects, but would do so in the same way CTM might support CCAC projects with no suggested overlap between the organizations.

----- end of motion -----

Various trustee discussions ensued regarding the details of the relationship and the motion itself. Concerns included the following:

- how did the Ludlow 21 Working Group (L21WG) form in the first place,
- did CTM actually have any representation on the L21WG since we did not formally vote on it,

- L21WG intended to incorporate in the near future therefore the relationship would change,
- L21WG had done positive work and CTM pulling out may not be wise.
- the motion was over-reaching and not necessary. Harm could come if we try we cannot foresee the future
- CTM & L21WG should move towards two separate organizations.
- how would the Ludlow 21 Report get implemented. We spent \$5000 on it.
- unintended / unexpected consequences of the motion as written,
- some summary of future plans that the L21WG had (parking, programming on the plaza, implementation of other suggestions from the Ludlow 21 report, addressing things that came up from the survey.
- the wording of CTM's bylaws on development & preservation of Clifton,

At approx 25 minutes into the topic, Trustee Marsh made a motion to call the question. Motion was seconded. Some discussion on the point of the motion was to move on after 25 minutes. Some audience members were frustrated that they also did not get to speak on this topic. One audience member was asked to leave the meeting after shouting profanity. Two thirds majority is required. Motion failed.

Discussion continued topics such as:

- Trustee Hyland expressed concerns that L21WG has taken actions to undermine issues the community want and continually put CTM in a bad position. He is frustrated with the perceived relationship with L21WG when they go back and forth on their stated association with CTM. He wants more clarity on what is the motivating agenda of L21WG and accountably to the community.
- Trustee M. Rich stated that the rights of an individual to act & take positions versus the being a member of a separate organization.

Vote on the motion was a tie so it failed to pass.

Executive Committee

Sizemore reported on various actions that the Executive Committee took:

- May 4 – letter to City Council & Mayor restating CTM's motion from 2014 about highest & best use of property at 319 Ludlow Avenue. Sizemore attended a Council Finance Committee Meeting during their series of Budget preparation meetings to restate the 2014 motion.
- May 13 – Sizemore attended the Zoning Hearing meeting on Whitfield Gardens development.
- June 9 – Sizemore attended a meeting with Clifton Market representatives and Mayor Cranley to answer questions about the May 4 CTM letter noted above.
- June 10 – letter to City Council & Mayor in support of Vice Mayor Mann's request to increase NSP funding to neighborhoods and also to support Invest In Neighborhoods becoming the administrator of the NSP processes.

Events Committee

Chairperson Nicholas Hollan reported on All-Star Clifton activities. The group showed a poster with various planned events:

July 9 – Field of Dreams at The Esquire.

July 11 – Vintage All Star Baseball game at UC.

July 12 – Homerun derby at Burnet Woods in the “meadow” at the bottom of the slide.

July 14 – All-Star game on a screen including beer and food trucks and activities. This will include a costume party.

Details will be at the Clifton Community Website calendar.

www.cliftoncommunity.org/calendar

Noting the previous month’s discussion and tabled motion for CTM to spend some money on this event, Hollan made a motion to spend up to \$900 for audio/visual equipment in support of showing the All-Star game on July 14 in the business district. Motion was seconded. Money is not available for this from the main organizing group because of Major League Baseball restrictions on financial support of game viewing events. Discussion clarified that there are no restrictions to broadcasting the game in Clifton and that rain plans are included in the event (if needed). Motion passed.

Golf Outing

Tom Dwyer reported on the 3rd Annual CTM Golf Outing event. Aug 22, 2pm. \$80 per player. Proceeds go to TriHealth Cancer Center. Still looking for hole sponsors. Look at the Clifton Community website for more details including registration form & online signup option.

Housing & Zoning Committee

Chairperson Adam Hyland reported on boundary issues including annexation at the border of Ruther on Bishop. Avondale Council President advised Hyland that they were not supportive of this annexation. Hyland spoke with City Planners who indicated that the City Planning Commission had decided on May 15th to only recognize Burnet Woods as part of CUF and Corryville despite our Bylaws including that area. Technically Burnet Woods has never been included in Clifton.

Hyland advised he did not know the outcome of the Zoning Hearing on Whitfield Gardens. Others advised the development was granted the variance on parking from the Zoning Hearing.

The liquor license application for Clifton Market was reviewed by the Housing & Zoning Committee (excluding Hyland) and they decided no action was required. June 29 was last day to act.

Hyland sent Trustees an email on July 6 with second draft of CTM Zoning & Land Use Review Process for Applicants. Hyland asked Trustees to review and provide feedback. Next step would be public review and then consideration by the Board for adoption.

Transportation Committee

Chairperson Mike Schur reported on various activities that the Committee has been working on including meetings he has had with Director Michael Moore of the City Department of Transportation & Engineering. There were 19 issues / activities presented. Details in the table below. Due to the time, no discussion was possible on the Committee's report.

Clifton Town Meeting Transportation Committee Active Issues List

Issue	Next CTM Actions	Notes and History
I-74 ramps to Central Parkway and Hopple Street Interchange	Priority - Monitor situation	CTM resolution June 2014; installed Aug 2014; last meeting Dec 2014 residents and DOTE; Received copy of resolution from Camp Washington; 4/30/15 discussed with M. Moore, DOTE will continue to monitor; 6/30/15 From M. Moore: ODOT announced they are proceeding with the construction of the new Hopple ramps in the summer of 2016. This means the existing ramps will be removed in late spring or summer of 2016
Clifton Hills Avenue Partial Barrier	Monitor situation and consider enforcement request for when UC and CSC classes resume in Aug	6/30/15: From M. Moore: DOTE doesn't anticipate any action on barrier until I-74 to Central Pkwy ramps close.
Elmore to Central Parkway Connector	Priority - Awaiting public meeting for input and update	5/20/15 TIGER grant applied for by City.
Traffic signal at Clifton Hills Ave and Central Pkwy	Awaiting recommendations from DOTE	Need communicated to DOTE by D. Grayson Mar 2015; Site of relocation after closure of temporary ramp from Central Pkwy to I-74 W is closed. Needed for Cent Pkwy crosswalk for DePaul Cristo Rey School; 4/30/15 discussed with M. Moore, DOTE aware, needed for pedestrian crossing, will evaluate for potential to limit volume on CHA; 6/30/15: Under discussion internally. DOTE not able to proceed immediately due to construction of ramp retaining walls.
Cross-walk signal too short at Ludlow and Rue de la Pax	Monitor situation, encourage others to request to raise priority with DOTE.	Raised at Feb 2015 CTM meeting by resident; Walk signal too short, can this be a service request or need to work with DOTE; Emailed DOTE and completed service request via 591-6000;
New Library crosswalk at Brookline and Jefferson/Ludlow	Priority - Awaiting recommendations from DOTE	Communicated need to DOTE by L. Thomas; Requested for new location of Clifton Library; 4/30/2015, on DOTE radar, no ETA; 6/30/2015: Under investigation with DOTE, DOTE has numerous requests along this line and understand the need with opening of the library
Speed Limit on Vine	Priority - Awaiting action by DOTE	Initiated by J. Harmon from C. Seelbach's office; CTM voted in support Mar 2015; letter sent to DOTE and City Council; 4/30/15 DOTE aware; 6/30/15: Under study by DOTE, counts and speed data captured June 2015;
Speed Limit on McAlpin	Priority - Awaiting study by DOTE	Initiated by CTM, included petition from residents; CTM voted in support Mar 2015; letter sent to DOTE and City Council; 4/30/15 DOTE aware; 6/30/15: Under study by DOTE;
Speed Limit on Ruther	Priority - Awaiting study by DOTE	Initiated by CTM, included petition from residents; CTM voted in support Mar 2015; letter sent to DOTE and City Council; 4/30/15 DOTE aware; 6/30/15: Under study by DOTE;
Audible crosswalk signal at Clifton and Glenmary	Monitor situation	CTM CC on request from resident to Councilman K Flynn; 4/30/15 DOTE unaware; 6/30/15: DOTE Under discussion internally;
Reconfiguration of intersection at Clifton and Glenmary	Monitor situation	CTM CC on request from resident to Councilman K Flynn; 4/30/15 DOTE aware of request to City Council; 5/30/15: DOTE Has not reviewed this intersection yet, scheduled for study in July/August;
Speed humps on Lowell	Await request from residents	Inquiry from resident; Recommended resident contact DOTE since there is a process in place for street calming; 4/30/15 should be initiated by residents; 6/30/2015 DOTE sent materials to resident 4/2015.
Speed humps on Loraine Ave	Await request from residents	Request from A. Hyland to add to list; Residents should contact DOTE to understand and initiate process. 4/30/15 should be initiated by residents; 6/30/15: DOTE sent materials in 2008.
Cross walk on Ludlow Avenue at Morrison	Discuss priority and actions	Request to K. Marsh Oct 2014; Need to have Transportation committee recommend and have CTM send letter; 6/30/15 No update from DOTE
Bicycle Sharrows on Ludlow and Jefferson Ave	Monitor replacement or formally request additional markings via City Council	Resurfacing of Ludlow Summer 2015 following CWW water main replacement; Inquiry to J Coppock regarding process; 5/1/15 email from J. Coppock, sharrows may not be appropriate on ludlow west of business dist, will make sure replaced East of BD, any other action requires request to City Council; 6/30/15 No update from DOTE
Central Parkway Bike Lanes	Monitor situation	Completion of Central Parkway bike lanes from Marshall to Ludlow delayed until completion of Hopple Interchange.
MLK West reconstruction	Monitor situation	Building Demo began Spring 2015, construction to begin late Summer 2015;
Resident Parking Permits near	Monitor situation	Spring 2015: Mayor Cranley stated possibility of removal;

Cincinnati State		
Crosswalk signal on Ludlow at Telford	Discuss with DOTE	Explore timing of crosswalk signal at Telford to reduce pedestrian crossing mid block near Esquire and Clifton Market

Public Safety Committee

Chairperson Kevin Marsh reported on plans for the future including upcoming meeting this Fall with Clifton Child Study Group and regular meetings with CPD District 5. Key focus is gathering feedback from the community on concerns and solutions. Robin (last name unknown), a member of the Citizens on Patrol, indicated the group is willing to join and collaborate with the Committee.

Parks Committee

Sizemore made a motion to replace Trustee Adam Hyland as the Chairperson of the Committee with Trustee Rama Kasturi. Motion passed. Kasturi reported on the recent news on the proposed levy to fund improvements and maintenance of parks in Cincinnati. The proposed levy requires about 5,900 signatures to be placed on the ballot this year.

Kasturi spoke with Parks administration, and they assured her that plans for parks improvements in Burnet Woods will be discussed in detail with the community before any implementation. As Burnet Woods is considered part of Corryville, CTM would work together with that community council and others.

Noise from Good Sam Hospital

Trustee Pantoja reported on various activities to understand noise complaints from the community regarding HVAC fans on the hospital roof. Current sound level measurements indicate that the noise are below city municipal code requirements. Many residents have come out with concerns.

There is a core group coming together to further discussion and address this topic. First meeting is on July 7. This is a formation type meeting to set objectives and milestones for group. The intent would be to collaborate with Good Sam Hospital to address the topic.

The report presented by Pantoja is below.

- Prior to April 2015, CTM approached on this issue by Steve Slack from Howell Avenue and later Dave Gutman from Howell Avenue
- Had April 21st meeting between Gutman, Pantoja, and Gene Barber, Director of Tri-Health Facilities. At this meeting:
 - Gene said that there had been just a few complaints.
 - He said they measured dB in 2013 and 2014. Measurements near hospital (Dixmyth, Terrace, Howell) were in upper 40's, low 50's. These are well below the 55-60 noise ordinance limit.

- He said that HVAC equipment hasn't changed greatly in design for many years and is well within design lifetime. Therefore he does not know why it now seems much worse last 2-3 years.
- Pantoja asked about sound barriers as had recently been placed next to HVAC in a Krogers somewhere in the City. Gene said that was ground level and that this solution is much harder on top of a tall building due to wind. Requires expensive structural changes because barriers act like a sail in the heavy wind.
- Gene said that their HVAC contractor suggested raising fan speed and that this led to reduction of 3 dB at the source (about 50%).
- Pantoja suggested a summer test (when noise is louder) of high and low fan speeds with residents aware of the time of each condition so they could give input whether this change had an impact. Also have Good Sam resource somewhere in the neighborhood to hear the noise from that perspective
- Pantoja also suggested new readings on a day with conditions (wind, temperature, etc.) that would give a worst case.
- Finally, Pantoja suggested that action might be needed even if below 55 dB if reasonable people would agree that sound is annoying
- Since then, more people have voiced concerns and there is a new plan
 - Create a core group of residents to treat this issue like a "project" with a strategy, action plan, etc.
- First meeting 7/7. If interested in attending, contact pantojaben@gmail.com.
- Proposed principles for the effort:
 - Start with assumption that Good Sam wants to be a good neighbor and give them the data needed to help troubleshoot the problem; don't start with adversarial relationship; give benefit of the doubt
 - Keep core group small enough to be effective but look for diversity in skills, location, perspective
- Possible milestone activities
 - Outline principles and strategy 7/7
 - Review strategy with David Mann's office for input
 - Share data collection strategy with Good Sam to improve acceptance of our results
 - Collect data
 - Noise data: noise levels, pitch varying over time, location, weather patterns
 - Community data: polling (not adversarial petitions) to estimate proportion of people who have noticed the issue, on what streets, and how they rate the level of annoyance on scale of 1-5
 - Solution data: find HVAC experts who are willing to suggest solutions to Good Sam
 - Additional meetings of neighbors as needed
 - Meet with Good Sam to share data and identify solutions that they could test. Partner with them to evaluate how well the solutions are working.

Treasurer Michael Moran reported on June results. \$6,044 income. \$3,322 expenses. Net income of \$2,722. House tour money continues to come in so a full House Tour financial overview is not ready, yet. The net income from the Tour is approximately \$17,000.

CTM has total assets/reserves of \$89,673 with one outstanding liability \$1,410 for LLC Tax liability.

Sizemore moved to approve the Treasurer's report. Motion passed.

Trustee Updates / Announcements

Reached this topic at 8:59pm. No announcements were made.

Public Q&A

Steve Slack asked that all interested in noise issues from Good Sam Hospital meet with him after the meeting.

Malcolm Montgomery asked about how a group such as Ludlow 21 forms and why they have not come to CTM meetings. Trustee M. Rich advised that Ludlow 21 had been to 4 CTM meetings presenting projects and status updates, and this included requests for funding.

Mary Rose Ventura asked to clarify the resolution failure on the relationship with Ludlow 21. She wondered how the legitimacy of new groups is formed. She did comment she has enjoyed the activities on the Plaza. She wondered where is CTM is going to go next on this topic.

Dawn Fosnaugh suggested that CTM send a representative to Corryville Council meetings. Trustee Moran advised we have a representative at Neighborhoods of Uptown (NOU) to discuss neighborhood issues with other surrounding community councils.

Jim (last name not known) announced that he had one of the signature petitions for the parks levy if anyone wanted to sign tonight.

Another resident asked if Ms. Ventura's question/comments could get an answer. Trustee Balz advised that the Board discussions would continue as new information developed (such as the outcome of Ludlow 21 incorporating) on this topic.

Adjournment/next meeting

The meeting was adjourned at 9:08 p.m.

The next CTM meeting is at 7 p.m., Monday, August 3, 2015, at the Clifton Recreation Center.