



**CTM Meeting Minutes
July 11, 2016
Clifton Recreation Center**

Present: Kevin Marsh, Michael Moran, Ben Pantoja, Eric Urbas, Adam Hyland, Nicholas Hollan, Shaun McCance, Joyce Rich, Peter Block, Malcolm Montgomery, Cindy Oakenfull,

Absent: Erin Hinson, Ashley Fritz, Rama Kasturi, Adam Balz.

A quorum is present. Meeting called to order at 7:04pm.

Police Report

No report was provided.

Officer Hageman can be reached at 513.569.8527; email is nicholas.hageman@cincinnati-oh.gov. See the Clifton Community website for other police contact info on the Public Safety page.

Fire Report

No report was provided.

Captain Caldwell can be reached at 513.352.2334; email is ken.caldwell@cincinnati-oh.gov; or visit the fire station on Ludlow Avenue.

Library Report

No library report was provided.

Recreation Center

Service Area Manager Tom Reese reported 35 spots left in the pre / post school program for the upcoming Fall. An online registration option is available. They expect to fill up quickly.

Online Rec Center Calendar is at

<http://cincyrec.org/search/basicprogram.aspx?k=Clifton%2BRecreation%2BCenter#results>

CCAC

CCAC Executive Director Leslie Mooney reported that the first ever 2016 Community Art Exhibit will be happening Aug 19 – Sept 3. This art show is open to anyone; it is not juried like the Golden Ticket Art Exhibit. Artists will submit one piece (any medium) to the exhibit for display and possible sale.

Online CCAC calendar of events is at <http://www.cliftonculturalarts.org/events/coming-events/>

And their schedule of classes is at <http://www.cliftonculturalarts.org/classes/all-classes/>

CBPA

No report was provided.

Minutes of the June CTM meeting were approved as submitted.

Treasurers Report

Treasurer Shaun McCance reported on corrected May results: \$10,016.34 income including \$6800 NSP granted funds. Expenses \$3,872.51. Net income of \$6,143.83.

June results: \$3,409.74 income. \$3,119.80 expenses including \$1,000 to sponsor a Wednesday on the Green last week at the CCAC (from NSP funds). Net income of \$289.96.

CTM has total assets/reserves of \$69,377.03 with no outstanding liabilities. This excludes the assets in the PayPal account.

YTD June income and expense versus 2016 budget was also presented:

June 2016 Budget Statement - Income

	Budget	Actual
Clifton Chronicle	\$13,000.00	\$7,707.00
Events		
Flowerpot Sponsorships	\$1,000.00	\$400.00
Golf Outing	\$11,000.00	\$2,800.00
Holidays on Ludlow	\$450.00	\$0.00
House Tour Sponsorship	\$0.00	\$1,050.00
Memorial Day	\$800.00	\$1,563.50
Other Events	\$4,000.00	\$0.00
Grants		
Annual Interest Grant	\$600.00	\$0.00
Neighborhood Support Program	\$6,800.00	\$6,800.00
Other Grants	\$0.00	\$1,649.03
Tri Health Grant	\$6,000.00	\$0.00
Interest Income	\$50.00	\$135.29
Memberships	\$5,000.00	\$1,690.00
Total	\$48,700.00	\$23,794.82

June 2016 Budget Statement - Expenses

	Budget	Actual
Administrative	\$0.00	\$367.00
Clifton Chronicle	\$15,400.00	\$7,354.63
Clifton Plaza LLC	\$2,500.00	\$4,706.22
Committees		
Beautification Committee	\$5,250.00	\$2,037.41
Business Committee	\$500.00	\$0.00
Education Committee	\$1,500.00	\$0.00
Executive Committee	\$850.00	\$0.00
Housing and Zoning Committee	\$750.00	\$0.00
Membership Committee	\$900.00	\$0.00
Other Committee	\$1,500.00	\$0.00
Website Committee	\$1,500.00	\$0.00
Events		
CliftonFest	\$3,000.00	\$0.00
Golf Outing	\$8,000.00	\$100.00
Holidays on Ludlow	\$1,500.00	\$2,303.30
Lantern Walk	\$575.00	\$39.68
Memorial Day	\$1,400.00	\$859.86
Story Tellers	\$1,000.00	\$0.00
Wednesdays on the Green	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00
Fundraising	\$2,500.00	\$150.00
Improvements		
Cincinnati Challenge Grant	\$500.00	\$0.00
Sidewalk Plaque Repair	\$2,000.00	\$0.00
Insurance	\$1,750.00	\$378.00
Uncategorized Expenses	\$0.00	\$1,478.93
Total	\$53,875.00	\$20,775.03

Discussion: Pantoja reported that TriHealth accepted \$4,400 of our request for \$6,000. Balance was not specific enough for their requirements. More work needs to be done here.

McCance advised most Committees have not spent any budgeted amounts. Holidays on Ludlow spending includes 2015 spending that would normally have been spent last year. Montgomery asked if Memberships are lower than expected. McCance is unable to capture all income from the PayPal account where some Memberships are paid.

Marsh asked what was needed to get McCance access to the CTM PayPal account. Trustee Moran advised there are some unresolved security issues and he will provide reports to McCance until these security issues are resolved.

Urbas moved to accept the Treasurer's report. Motion passed.

Executive Committee

President Eric Urbas shared the details on the City's Community Budget Request process. These were also discussed in the June CTM meeting.

- Formerly called "Community Priority Request". This process helps the city decide what items to budget for over the next biennial budget planning cycle (this is for 2018-19).
- Each community council can submit up to three official projects. A website was added this year to allow anyone to input ideas: <http://www.cincinnati-oh.gov/planning/neighborhood-project-suggestions>
- The scope of projects can include:
 - Transportation Infrastructure such as road improvements, cross walks, parking, sidewalks, bicycle infrastructure, curbs, etc.
 - Other Physical Improvements such as green spaces, public spaces, benches, public garbage cans, remediation's (correcting/repairing existing items but not routine maintenance), etc.\
 - Neighborhood branding/identification such as way finding signage, banners, gateways, historical markers, etc.
 - Safety items like studies, skid resistant pavement treatments, police detail, increased lighting, etc.
 - Anything that the city can spend money on for the benefit of our neighborhood.

A complete list of acceptable and non-acceptable examples will be on the website.

- Schedule
 - Projects Requests due to the City September 23, 2016.
 - We will take suggestion starting now by email to contactctm@cliftoncommunity.org. Please put Community Budget Request in the title.
 - Discussions on possible projects will continue at the August Board meeting.
 - Deadline for input from CTM is before the Sept Board meeting on Sept 11.

Clifton Market hosted an event on July 9 where CTM sold alcohol as a fundraiser. McCance is still tallying proceeds of this fundraising event.

Urbas moved to pass a rule for printed materials by/on behalf of CTM.

Printed materials intended for distribution outside of a working group or committee, that state or imply they are from Clifton Town Meeting or any of it's committees shall be shared with all trustee's at least 24 hours before printing.

Items for the Chronicle that simply report news, history, human interest, advertising, etc. would be exempted. Chronicle editorial items expressing opinions or positions will have one of these two statements added in the body or in the by line:

“The opinions expressed represent an official position of the Clifton Town Meeting Board.”
“The opinions expressed DO NOT represent an official position of the Clifton Town Meeting Board.”

---end of motion----

Discussion:

Urbas advised two reasons for this motion:

1. To provide a reasonable chance for trustees to comment on items that will be printed and handed out at events, meetings, etc.
2. Physically printed items are difficult to correct once printed and distributed. There is practically no way collect and correct these items once they are distributed. Other outlets such as the CTM website, CTM Facebook , etc. can be edited and corrected instantly if necessary.

Block asked if there are any consequences of violating the rule. Urbas stated no, and he hoped for professional courtesy to be utilized. Pantoja asked what the process is for stopping something contradictory going out. Urbas indicated that a Trustee would need to make a motion by email to address such an issue.

Rich asked if things such as posters need to be seen. Urbas advised that yes this would apply. Marsh asked about the emails that CTM sends, as these are not recallable. Urbas advised that while he understood this, he did not see a need to have those apply. Hollan asked about interviews with media. Urbas advised those are too impromptu to provide advance notice.

Montgomery advised this was just a “standing rule” and thus easily modifiable in the future. Urbas confirmed same. McCance shared that the idea avoid creating an overly complicated process.

Motion passed.

LLC Committee

Chairperson Urbas advised a meeting is set for July 16 to discuss at least the following issues:

- Landscape and water system maintenance.
- Electrical system and lighting maintenance.
- Tax Bills from 2011 and 2012 that are not in alignment with the tax filings we were provided by the CPA who prepared the filings.
- Liquor license ownership and use.

Rich indicated that CPBA funded the liquor license. Urbas indicated CTM has no insurance related to having a liquor license.

Ad Hoc – “Save the CCAC” Committee

Trustee Montgomery made a motion to set the scope, 2016 objectives and goals for this ad-hoc committee.

In support of the April 4, 2016 Resolution by Clifton Town Meeting to Preserve Clifton Cultural Arts Center and to Seek Guaranteed Access to Quality Public School Education, which states that, “Clifton Town Meeting (CTM) finds Clifton Cultural Arts Center (CCAC) to be an essential asset to the schoolchildren and adult citizens of Clifton, Uptown and beyond” and, which requests that “Cincinnati Public Schools (CPS) not terminate the 2005 lease agreement with CCAC which would result in the loss of this essential asset to Clifton, Fairview-Clifton German Language School, Uptown and the Cincinnati community-at-large”

CTM hereby establishes the ad hoc Save the CCAC Committee with Chairperson Malcolm Montgomery.

The Committee is charged with the responsibility to identify and execute actions to maintain the Clifton Cultural Arts Center (CCAC) in its current location in the former Clifton School building in order to:

- Preserve the community’s significant investment of funds and volunteer resources in the establishment and operation of CCAC and in the extensive repairs and renovations to the former Clifton School building
- Preserve CCAC’s unique role in developing cultural vibrancy and intra-community and inter-community connections among the residents of Clifton, Uptown, and the City of Cincinnati, and in providing arts programming to students at Fairview-Clifton German Language School, Rockdale Academy and other CPS schools
- Educate the CPS Board of Education and Administration about CCAC’s vital role in developing and maintaining Clifton as a strong community and in supporting the educational strength of Fairview Clifton German Language School and Rockdale Academy through arts programming
- Develop open channels of communication with CPS to discuss their goals and needs and alternative approaches to addressing these without terminating CCAC’s lease
- Explore the option of purchasing the building from CPS or an amendment to the lease that ensures CCAC’s continued existence in the former Clifton School building
- Educate the community on the value & benefits of having CCAC remain in the former Clifton School building
- Engage the community in multiple ways to understand their interest in CCAC remaining a vibrant community asset housed in the former Clifton School Building
- Engage with potential community partners (including but not limited to CPS, CCAC, UC, Cincinnati State, Uptown Consortium, City of Cincinnati) to understand how they might support CCAC remaining in the former Clifton School Building

Discussion: Marsh stated the motion implies that CTM is exploring the option to purchase the building and this is not our role. Hyland advised we should keep the buyer open.

Rich asked how the Education Committee goals differ from what is presented in this motion. Hollan stated that CTM Education Committee’s goals are different and focused on engaging the interest of the community in a guaranteed way to have high quality education.

Pantoja stated he sees things as this new “Save the CCAC” Committee is the active working team on CCAC issues where the Education Committee is passively supporting and likewise,

the Education Committee is actively working on education issues where the “Save the CCAC” Committee is passively supporting.

Motion passed.

Montgomery presented a motion for Community Outreach Effort

1. Inform residents of Clifton, CUF, and Spring Grove Village of issues pertaining to access to quality public schools.
 2. Learning their views, concerns, and preferences with regard to these issues.
- Spend \$1000 on a community outreach effort from the Education Committee budget.

Motion to table the motion was made and passed due to it being brought up with no prior notice to Trustees and having not been discussed within the Education Committee. In addition, it was not clear what the \$1000 was for since no full plan for community outreach had been agreed upon previously.

Montgomery made a motion for “Fair and Balanced Representation of School Access Options” : Resolved that any effort to educate the community about school access options be fair and balanced, identify the pro’s and con’s of each, and state clearly whether CTM has or has not endorsed same.

Motion to table the motion was made and passed due to it being brought up with no prior notice to Trustees and having not been discussed within the Education Committee.

Education Committee

Chairperson Nicholas Hollan reported on various activities that have happened recently.

CPS Town Hall meeting on June 7 that was facilitated by a UC. This meeting was organized by CPS. Small table groups were held and questions were created. UC facilitators summarized all the questions and advised that CPS would be generating answers to all of them. Next meetings would happen toward the end of July to continue the discussions.

Working Group (CTM, CCAC, SGV & CUF Community Councils, Fairview LSDMC) has been meeting weekly for the past few months (and has been meeting regularly since last year). Last two weeks the Group has been working on a joint statement to which all parties can agree. Holland sketched out the current form of the joint statement:

- Keep CCAC in their building
- Have a neighborhood school component inside of the Fairview campus that begins with just the Kindergarten class and grows organically over time.
- Expand the Fairview campus with more building(s) to allow for current growth and then scale back this growth.

Hollan noted that the previous special 30% set aside for Clifton is no longer available per new CPS magnet school enrollment policy.

Holland indicated his opinion that this joint proposal meets the needs of all the stakeholders in a “win-win-win”. Further, some additional tweaks need to be made, but he felt we are very close to bringing something to the Board for approval. The Group will meet again this week.

Montgomery thanked Oakenfull for contributing the core of the idea for the co-location of a neighborhood school on the Fairview Clifton campus.

Tom Reese, a member of the LSDMC, indicated that language related to the levy should be removed as CPS employees cannot actively engage in lobbying efforts around levy votes.

Montgomery indicated that the issue of community engagement needs to be addressed and this will be coming up again. Marsh stated that it would be impossible to stop the community engagement effort that CTM charged the CTM Education Committee to perform unless the Board voted to change the direction of the Education Committee. Block stated we have experts who can help with community engagement.

Business Committee

Trustee Rich advised that CTM won both NBDIP grants:

1. \$52k for the updating of our NBD plan, which currently is from the 1970's
2. \$30k for the repairs of the bronze plaques in the BD sidewalks.

Trustee Pantoja advised an update on the Plaza café lights. Meeting was held in the Plaza with Niehoff Studio representative, and the plan made sense to everyone. Next step is getting the hardware to make 3 attachments on the building. Then a final mockup will be done with wire on the mount points to check the design before the lights will be installed.

New store MAYA has opened on Ludlow Avenue – handmade jewelry & crafts by Navajo & Zuni artists and by Mexican designers.

New store Goin' Postal has opened on Jefferson Avenue. FedEx / DHL / UPS / etc. shipment & drop off.

Events Committee

Chairperson Nicholas Hollan reported that the kickoff of the Cincinnati Neighborhood Games happened this weekend. Events were held last week and will be held through next weekend. Clifton has the 2nd highest participation of all 52 neighborhoods. We received a bronze medal for Youth HORSE basketball.

Trustee Urbas advised that the Golf Outing is August 27th. At this point, the sub-committee has developed 13 sponsorships and 20 businesses who are making donations to the raffle. The online store is open and posters are going up. Urbas thanked the sub-committee that was working on producing the outing. Next meeting is July 25.

Transportation Committee

Committee member Marsh reported on behalf of Chairperson Mike Schur. Marsh and Schur met with City DOTE Director Michael Moore to review progress & discuss CTM priorities as part of the regular meetings the Committee seeks with DOTE.

Summary: DOTE will be involved in planning / construction around MLK West including figuring out ways to extended planned & existing shared use paths (pedestrian / bike). DOTE did not apply for a grant to widen MLK in the Corryville area up to Jefferson. There is an active Federal TIGER grant application for the Elmore Connector Bridge, and DOTE is awaiting feedback from USDOT on this application.

Discussed the disposition of the temporary traffic control / barricade on Clifton Hills Avenue. Moore stated that he wanted to know Clifton's position. Schur / Marsh agreed to publicize the topic, gather community input, and seek to have CTM take a position in the coming weeks. Marsh noted to Trustees that since the device was designed to be temporary that the default position should be to remove the device unless the community wanted it to stay.

Discussed the potential of a "turn signal" from westbound Ludlow onto southbound Clifton. This intersection has become chaotic. DOTE will put a camera up to count traffic flows and provide feedback.

Next meeting will be in Clifton to review possible locations for pedestrian crosswalks / onsite viewing of traffic control priorities for which the community has already voiced concern.

Marsh reported that he had a separate meeting with DOTE to discuss the Community Priority Budget Request project that was approved for \$7500 of staff time to create a Neighborhood Bicycling Infrastructure Plan. CTM did not learn about this approved money until June. Marsh met with Mel McVay and they outlined potential ideas on community engagements that would lead to the creation of the plan. DOTE would work with the Transportation Committee to create the plan. Marsh indicated that infrastructure meant permanent and temporary/pop-up types as well as things on public right-of-way and private property. Examples include sharrows, signs, education in schools / rec centers, bike valets at community events, bike maintenance stands, racks, storage, etc.

General outline: Open House engagement in Fall 2016, draft plan ideas from this engagement, 2nd Open House engagement in late Winter 2017, prepare final plan in Spring 2017 for presentation CTM Board.

Housing & Zoning Committee

Chairperson Adam Hyland reported that there is an issue with the business operating at 364 Ludlow Avenue. Zoning code states that 80% of the windows must be transparent to the sidewalk. Hyland has discussed the matter with the tenant and the owner. Tenant, "Vote Ohio", discussed the matter with their landlord. The tenant did unblock the windows for awhile, but they have returned to having them mostly blocked again.

Hyland suggested that the Board would need to consider in the future if it was interested in enforcement of zoning issues by making complaints to the City after good faith discussions with tenants / owners.

Montgomery indicated the Business Committee was interested in reviewing and possibly changing some of the zoning requirements in the Clifton Business District.

Bylaws Committee

Chairperson Ben Pantoja reported on the first meeting of the Committee. Committee finds there could be a need for standing rules, governance/operating procedures as well as bylaws changes. Pantoja moved for the Board to approve the following Committee Scope and 2016 Priorities:

Scope

Develop proposals to improve operating procedures. Final documentation of these proposals, if approved, can be in the form of changes in Bylaws or in the form of less formal documents such as “Trustee Expectations”, “Board Rules”, or “Best Practices”.

Priorities for 2016

- Email voting process.
- Expectations for “Acceptance” of a report.
- Revisit the Conflict of Interest statement so that it is not so broad that almost anything could be a conflict of interest.
- Develop recommendations for external communications by Trustees
- Further clarify what to do if there is a tie in Trustee elections.

Discussion: Montgomery indicated that using a “standing rule” would allow the Board to try out a change without modifying the bylaws.

Motion passed.

Pantoja advised a possible new process to hold email votes by the Board. There was no discussion on vote on the process.

Trustee Announcements & Liaison updates

McCance – thanked Daniel Ames for picking up trash regularly in the business district.

Marsh – thanked Kip Eagen for past coordination of Utility Box art projects. There have two rounds of this so far. Keep Cincinnati Beautiful (KCB) has a grant application process open that could be a potential funding source for a 3rd round of Utility Box art. Marsh moved that CTM act as a fiscal agent for the application of a grant from KCB for another round of Utility Box art, and that CTM provide positive support for this application.

Discussion – No CTM funds are sought. Kip advised he has a financial commitment from the Clifton Community Fund towards the project. Rich advised she has met with KCB this year, and would meet with Kip and KCB in support of the grant application process.

Motion passed.

Pantoja – announced he has become a Clifton Market Board member.

Public Q&A

Daniel Ames – “as he remembers the history”: early 1960’s was the reconvening of Clifton Town Meeting. He believes that some of the members of the Clifton Village were meeting after Clifton was annexed into the City of Cincinnati. These meetings were the original CTM group and they happened around 1908. In 1961, City proposed turning Clifton Ave into a 4 lane road, and about 300 residents got together to oppose this action.

Mary Beth – parent in the community. Supports the idea of an elementary school, but wants more discussion about the structure around the school. She wants that school to have access to the Rec Center. Second topic – she believes that in about 7 years there will be less Cliftonites in the Fairview Clifton School due to no special set aside.

Adjournment/next meeting

The meeting was adjourned at 8:56 p.m.

The next CTM meeting is at 7 p.m., Monday, August 1, 2016, at the Clifton Recreation Center.

Respectfully submitted by Kevin Marsh, CTM Secretary.