



**CTM Meeting Minutes
March 5, 2018
Clifton Recreation Center**

Present: Adam Balz, Kevin Marsh, Buddy Goose, Adam Hawse, Pat Borders, Joyce Rich, Christine Celsor, Peter Block, Gina Marsh, Rama Kasturi, Vince Metzger, Malcolm Montgomery, Eric Urbas

Absent: Ashley Fritz, Seth Maney

A quorum is present. Meeting called to order at 7:00pm

Police Report

Neighborhood Liaison Officer Nicholas Hageman advised on various arrests that had been made recently in Clifton. No major crimes in 2018 YTD. No auto thefts. Burglaries are double versus prior year to date. Please keep your homes locked up and secured.

What is the procedure for working with homeless people sleeping on park benches? Police use their discretion on a case by case basis. The neighborhood has influence on how the department works on this issue. People that are acting unsafely (such as wandering in traffic)

Officer Hageman can be reached at 513.569.8527; email is nicholas.hageman@cincinnati-oh.gov. See the Clifton Community website for other police contact info on the Public Safety page.

Fire Report

No report.

Captain James Kettler can be reached at 513.352.2334; email is james.kettler@cincinnati-oh.gov; or visit the fire station on Ludlow Avenue.

Library Report

Clifton Branch Manager Lisa Hamrick advised an update of upcoming events. March 24th will be a walking tour of homes in Clifton. Quarterly TED Talk viewing and discussions - March 11 is "Who Are You? Investigating Personality." March 1 is a listening on protest songs. Lots of teens events happening.

Information about the Clifton Branch can be found online at <http://www.cincinnati-library.org/branches/clifton.html>

Recreation Center

Service Area Manager Tom Reese reported on some upcoming events:

Art of Drawing – Wednesday evenings at 6:30pm for beginners.

Mini-camp for Spring Break – March 26-30.

Fundraising continues for “Lego Mindstorm” – a robotics program. 4-6 grade focused. Seeking donations for the gear for this program. Total requirement is \$1500 to buy the kits. Tom has matching funds available for any donation made. Half the money has been raised already for this program. First four kits have been purchased.

Online Rec Center Calendar is at

<http://cincyrec.org/search/basicprogram.aspx?k=Clifton%2BRecreation%2BCenter#results>

CPBA

Attending a City Council Committee hearing tomorrow on the Entertainment District approval. Will advise by email on the outcomes.

CCAC

CCAC Executive Director Leslie Mooney reported on up coming up:

Wump Bucket Muppets.

March 17 – Madcap Puppets

Sunset Salons – March 21 – Chocolate.

New exhibit opening – what they wore.

Wednesdays in the Woods will start in May. This will be in Burnet Woods.

Fotofocus location will be at the Esquire and possibly at World Peace Yoga.

Online CCAC calendar of events is at <http://www.cliftonculturalarts.org/events/coming-events/>

And their schedule of classes is at <http://www.cliftonculturalarts.org/classes/all-classes-by-age/>

Housing & Zoning Committee

DePaul Cristo Rey High School Development Project

Chairperson Christine Celsor introduced Sister Jean Basett the President.

Zoning documents updated and submitted for the Zoning Variance Hearing on Wed March 7. She shared 5 topics:

1. Traffic increase on Clifton Hills – once project is completed, they believe over 90% of the traffic will happen via the Central Parkway
2. New semi-circle driveway on Clifton Hills – will be used during construction for pick up / drop off for intern students. Resubmitted plans show that it will be eliminated after construction.
3. Removal of trees – 3 or 4 major trees will be removed and replaced with new trees.
4. Secondary egress on Clifton Hills – required for safety. Will have limited use – about 30 minutes in the morning for some large vehicles that cannot turn around easily otherwise. Will also use it to empty the parking lot after large special events.

5. Hillside overlay zone concerns – Messer Construction will inspect current state of homeowners properties to ensure that there will be no impact from upcoming constructions. They have submitted geotechnical engineering plans.

Truck traffic will all happen via Central Parkway driveway not Clifton Hills as part of the redesigned plans.

Resident on Clifton Hills raised concerns about keeping Clifton Hills residential. Removing major trees and having secondary egress on Clifton Hills do not support a residential feel. Residents had a proposal to give up some of their day time parking. Part of the hillside retaining wall will be removed. There's water issues currently in this area – some flooding...some mosquitos.

Resident on Clifton Hills who does not live across from the school is concerned that not all Clifton Hills residents have been invited to the various meetings with the school. They will send their names to Sister Jean. Concern is students walking in the street in the dark as there are no sidewalks. What will happen once the traffic barrier is removed?

Celsor emphasized the community engagement is important in big projects. This plan has improved substantially from the original. Housing & Zoning Committee met on this topic recently and made the following recommendation as a motion:

CTM submit a letter of no objection to the City regarding the revised construction plans and variance requests for De Paul Cristo Rey with the following conditions:

1. Secondary egress to Clifton Hills is only approved if it is required for safety by code or a City department.
2. The measures recommended by the Hillside Trust are followed, whether this is a requirement that a geotechnical engineer is required to be on site during construction, a performance bond to cover any potential damages, or other meaningful measures.
3. That the temporary access drive along Clifton Hills is enforceable (it must be removed after construction).
4. That the nature of the secured access is clarified (who will be able to access the gate and when).

Discussion on the motion:

Some trustees wanted to know what is neighbors' response to the motion.

Resident - How can the Board agree to this? Nothing has changed dramatically except for the trees. Water from the hillside flooded Clifton Hills Ave after this past weekend's rain.

Trustee Hawse noted that service truck flows were moved in the new plan, the semi-circle drive is temporary. Letter from the Hillside District Trust indicates support and that improvements will be obtained from the reworking of the retaining wall.

Trustee Montgomery asked if the secondary access lane was 2 lane and why. Sister Jean advised it is 2 lanes in a one way direction, and they need a way to empty the parking lot if the primary access point is blocked due to accident.

Hawse made a motion to amend point 3 with “returned to it’s original condition”.

Resident asked if the secondary egress can be made 1 lane and moved further away from the hill? Sister Jean advised that the City Planning Dept required that a management plan be developed.

Motion to amend passed.
Amended motion passed.

Treasurers Report

Treasurer Buddy Goose reported Monthly results. Income - \$5011.25. Expenses \$744.45 CTM has total assets/reserves of \$71,712.84.

Motion to accept the Treasurer’s report passed.

Education Committee

Chairperson Vince Metzger advised that the MOU between UC School of Education and CPS has not been signed, but it has been officially recognized that it will happen.

Enrollment is looking like two preschool, one K, and one 1st grade class at this point, and it is still growing.

Transportation & Public Safety Committee

Committee member Kevin Marsh reported that there will be meetings on March 1 and 7 at 6pm to gather community input on the D5 HQ location. You only need to attend one. There will be a meeting in April to summarize all input gathered for each location option. March 1 is at Public Services Bldg, 1115 Bates Ave. March 7 is at College Hill Rec Center, 5545 Belmont Ave.

Regarding the March 1 meeting, it was very well attended by residents from all over D5.

Key messages:

- Most police service calls are to the southern most (CUF) and northern most (College Hills) regions of D5.
- Most major roads in D5 run north and south.
- Fleet maintenance and fuel costs are an important ongoing consideration.
- Keep an open mind during the selection process.
- City will use the District 3 processes which were very successful in site selection as well as design elements.
- Ultimately City Planning in consultation with Police Chief will make a final recommendation to City Council for a site.
- Break ground during later 2018 and open by Summer 2020.

Site selection criteria (some of these are musts and some are wants but this was not made clear).

- 3 acres of land. Properly zoned or easily rezoned.
- Accommodate approx 130 officers & staff on 3 shifts.
- Approx 3000 sq feet (could be 1 or 2 stories).
- 70 personal + 70 police + 10 visitor parking spaces.
- Clear sight lines for entry to access roads.
- Flat ground. No easements.
- Able to include community space in the building like what D3 HQ has.
- Within a 15-20 minute walk of a business district / concentration of homes.

20 possible sites were presented along with pros / cons of each site. Most were unworkable based on the selection criteria. 6 met the criteria. Table maps were offered as a way to attendees to provide feedback. No voting or group feedback summary was completed. April 3 meeting (McKie Rec Center, 6-8pm) will provide an update on site selection, discussion of design and possible public art components, and updated schedule of next steps.

- Central Parkway
- Colerain Ave Access
- Dane Ave
- Hamilton Ave
- Police Impound Lot
- Runnymede – Colerain & Virginia

K. Marsh reviewed the results of the Committee's survey to obtain prioritization from the community on un-signalized crosswalks that should be considered for a crosswalk paddle device installation. Committee summarized results in a motion that K. Marsh made as follows:

"Before end of March 2018, CTM will submit the 3 top locations from the Transportation & Public Safety Committee Pedestrian Crosswalk Survey to City DOTE for further consideration & action. That City DOTE action would be to install the crosswalk paddle device shared at the February meeting. CTM will also provide full survey results showing the other crosswalk priority list to City DOTE for their future reference.

Top 3 locations are as follows:

1. Clifton Ave at Clifton Mosque and Fairview- Clifton School
2. Glenmary at Brookline
3. McAlpin at CCAC and Fairview- Clifton School

Specifically, the recipients of CTM's submission will be Interim Director Don Gindling and Senior City Planner Melissa McMay."

Motion passed.

Clifton House Tour

Trustee Adam Balz reported the following for the House Tour:

We have 7 houses and 1 Clifton icon for the tour.

Vicki Black agreed to layout the House Tour booklet.

Committee is meeting two times a month. Last meeting was very productive.

Business Committee

Chairperson Joyce Rich that we have 4 participating businesses in the Façade Improvement Program, and we have some additional remaining funds.

The Entertainment District will be discussed at City Council this week. If it passes, then businesses can start applying for liquor licenses to the State through the normal application processes.

Based on email vote by CTM Trustees, NBDIP pre-application was submitted on March 2. Small grant for planning/design of a neighborhood district gateway was submitted. No location was specified in the pre-application.

Bylaws Committee

Chairperson Malcolm Montgomery shared the names of the Committee along with 2 advisors, and then he reviewed the following Committee report:

Report and Proposal by the Bylaws Committee to the Board of Trustees March 5, 2018

Mission

The mission of the Bylaws Committee is to identify opportunities for improvement in operating procedures for CTM. Improvements may take either of two forms: changes in bylaws, which require a vote of the general membership; or changes in standing rules, which require a majority vote of the board.

During the past year, the Bylaws Committee solicited and identified questions and concerns about operating procedures. The full committee met on February 27, 2018, to consolidate its findings and draft its mission for the Board to ratify, or give such additional direction as it may wish. We note that this review comes three years after the last revision (2015), as recommended by Invest in Neighborhood's Model Bylaws for community councils.

The Committee wishes to express its appreciation to our two advisors, Howard Tolley, PhD, JD, and Derek Tucker, JD, our pro bono attorney from Taft, Stettinius, and Hollister, for sharing with us their expert knowledge of bylaws creation and attendant legal considerations.

Opportunities for Improvement

Keeping in mind the distinction between amendments for bylaws and standing rules, we identified three areas that rise to the level of bylaws and therefore should be our first priority, and a list of issues to be considered for standing rules. We may also suggest organizational and language clarifications.

Priority Bylaws Concerns

Nominations/Elections

We propose that our committee should review the process by which CTM nominates and elects Trustees, and consider whether CTM members should elect an independent nominating committee at the same time trustees are elected. (Currently, incumbent Trustees appoint the Nominating Committee.)

Voting Rights and Meeting Procedures

We propose to consider COI of Trustees when voting and the rules of procedure for membership meetings.

We propose also to explore the issues of email or other online discussion and voting, and transparency of internal communications to the public

Financial Best Practices

We propose to study recommended financial practices, such as an annual audit of the books, procedures to ensure that funds are expended only as duly authorized, and transparent processes that promote public confidence in the organization.

Other Issues for Bylaws or Standing Rules

1. Clarify membership for Non-Profits in Bylaws Article IV
2. Clarification of distinction between Neighborhood Resident members and institutional members and their respective voting rights in Bylaws Article IV
3. Whether to hold general meetings twice a year, spring and fall, or only in December.
4. Appointment of a Parliamentarian
5. Consideration of major issues by the membership
6. Eligibility to stand for election to the Board
7. Online/electronic voting by Board of Trustees (if any)
8. Confidentiality of deliberations v. Transparency in decision-making
9. Trustee authority to speak on behalf of CTM
10. Committee reports to the Board -- Public disclosure, significance
11. Plaza LLC obligations and control
12. Annual financial audit, fiscal year, bank deposits, disposition of assets
13. Periodic Governance Committee review of both the Bylaws and Standing Rules/Policies.

14. CTM Google email server adds Confidentiality Policy to all mail: "All communications using this group are private and confidential to CTM. Do not forward to other entities or individuals without the express approval of the Board of Trustees of CTM.
15. CTM Chairperson and Liaison Roles
16. Requiring that the Board review the Bylaws and Standing Rules periodically
17. Other Standing Rule/Policy Proposals based on committee member concerns and time available.

Process and Schedule

We propose the general process by which our Committee will conduct business to be as follows:

1. We will contemplate and research issues with our by-laws
2. We will compile changes that the committee agrees will mitigate those issues through by-law changes or standing rules.
3. We will bring our recommendations to full Board for discussion and voting.
4. We intend to complete these steps by May 2018, with further goals decided at that time, at the direction of the Board. If changes are to affect the 2018 December Board election, they will need to be ratified at a member meeting held several months earlier, preferably in June but no later than September.

Respectfully submitted to the Board of Trustees by the Bylaws Committee on March 5, 2018

Adam Balz
Brad Hawse
Adam Hyland
Kevin Marsh
Frank Miller
Malcolm Montgomery (Chair)
Michelle Murphy

Mongtomery made a motion to approve.

Discussion:

K. Marsh advised that the recommendations regarding the Nominating Committee should not be necessary. There have been no past issues, and the proposal seems to be defining a solution before an actual concern or problem has been identified. K. Marsh made a motion to amend the direction for the Committee to just, "We propose that our committee should review the process by which CTM nominates and elects Trustees."

Balz thought that we should reword the Nominating Committee section of the bylaws, but that the amendment made sense. The Nominating Committee does not pick people to serve.

G. Marsh – we should not give any Nominating Committee the power to prevent people from running for Trustee.

Kasturi – how would this Nominating Committee work? Clifton Market Nominating Committee was given significant power and this lead to difficulties. We should leave it exactly as it is.

Metzger – are we proposing to rewrite to the bylaws to state what we currently do? Montgomery advised no, we are only studying possible changes at this point.

Motion to amend is approved.

Amended motion passed.

Golf Outing

Trustee Eric Urbas described the Friend of Clifton Award selection process.

Urbas made a motion, “The Golf Outing Committee will present a list of 2-3 candidates for the Friend of Clifton Award asking the Board to approve that any of these person can be a possible recipient. The final decision for the award would then be made by the Golf Outing Committee (majority vote of the Committee).”

Motion passed.

Update on the outing. Committee is talking with Clifton Community Fund on options for beneficiaries. No proposal has been finalized for the Board to review and act upon at this time.

Committee Work Product

Board discussion regarding what and when should at CTM Committee be able to share the results of community engagement (meetings, surveys and the like).

Various view points expressed including the following:

We should share the community engagement results. We should not censor.

There will always be topics that are difficult in our community.

If the survey is poorly prepared, you don’t get good information. If the survey is biased, you get bad information.

There’s some risk in publishing results, but it is small.

Survey’s sometimes have negative results.

Survey results are usually published in summary form. We don’t have to share individual results and comments.

Celsor made a motion to let Committees publish results of surveys using their own best judgements while the Bylaws Committee considers this matter further.

Motion passed.

Trustee Updates / Announcements

Sean Mullaney, Chairperson of Arts & Culture Committee, advised the recently completed survey results indicated that they should provide more support things towards existing events rather than create new events. Also, we should consider creating a Clifton Artist Directory as a community resource. Next steps, Committee will release the survey results & continue discussions on implementation.

Rich advised that David Wolf of the USPS indicated the post office relocation would occur on or before June 30. New location is 366 Ludlow Ave next to The Whole Bowl.

Goose advised that CliftonFest is Oct 5 evening and all day Oct 6. Permits are in place.

Kasturi shared that we can enjoy Spring in Burnet Woods.

Montgomery thanked Lisa Hamrick for having the Library host the display of ideas/designs from DAAP regarding their design study class on the Howell Avenue Development project.

Plaza lights update – project got halted due to lack of clear liability for installation. Business District Committee suggested waiting to see the designs of the Howell Avenue / Parking lot development. Lights are all with Montgomery. No conclusions on how to proceed, but several Trustees wanted to meet & review possible options to do something.

Urbas thanked Michelle Murphy for connecting CTM with Walter Langsdorn for the House Tour efforts.

The Feb 2018 meeting minutes were approved as submitted.

Public Q&A

Kathy Rentz resident shared an idea. Important item is missing from the regular reports at CTM – the financial status of the Clifton Market. This is a community owned store. It's health affects our property values and vitality of our neighborhood. Clifton Market Board is not communicating currently with the owners. Last meeting was several months ago. Recent meetings have been closed. She spoke with a member of the Clifton Board about the plans to share information with community.

A short business report at each CTM meeting would
She suggested CTM Trustees vote to request such a report.

Kasturi advised she was the Communications Director of Clifton Market. She shared recent meetings have been closed due to concerns with how the Clifton Market was performing. All future meetings will be public. The store is doing better than it was in prior months, but not as good as the original projections. These projections have been revised. The intention is to use the June elections to reconstitute the Board of Directors.

Lisa Hamrick gave a presentation about the benefits of passing the upcoming Public Library tax levy.

Resident advised about a March 28 event – Discussions with MSD Experts – being held by The League of Women Voters. 6-8:30pm. Mt. Auburn Presbyterian Church.

Aftab Pureval, Hamilton County Clerk of Courts, shared a story about how he ran for the office. He has raised wages, offered comprehensive health care, made other changes, and saved \$1MM in taxpayer funds. He is now running for Ohio District 1, US House of Representatives.

Adjournment/next meeting

The meeting was adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

The next CTM meeting is at 7 p.m., Monday, April 2, 2018, at the Clifton Recreation Center.

Respectfully submitted by Kevin Marsh, CTM Secretary.