



**CTM Board Meeting Minutes
November 4, 2019
Clifton Recreation Center**

Present: Peter Block, Pat Borders, Joe Brunner, Brian Duffy, Stephanie Gilbreath, Buddy Goose, Robert Hamburg, Brad Hawse, Catherine Hicks, Seth Maney, Kevin Marsh, Vince Metzger, Malcolm Montgomery

Absent: Rama Kasturi, Joyce Rich

A quorum is present. Meeting called to order at 7:02 pm by President Hawse.

I. October Meeting Minutes

Secretary Brunner moved to adopt the minutes of the October 7, 2019 Board meeting. Vice President Borders seconded the motion. A vote was taken. The motion passed unanimously.

II. Police and Fire Reports

A. Police

Officer Hageman reported on the crime statistics for the month of November. Theft from autos is up from 0 to 4, but otherwise all crime statistics are low. Officer Hageman continued to stress prevention, i.e. locking doors and not leaving valuables in your car. He advised that UC's homecoming is this Saturday and that traffic will be very congested. He also asked everyone to be aware of people attempting to steal delivery packages with the upcoming holiday season.

B. Fire

Lt. Ramstetter from Engine 34 reported on the station's recent activities. October was not a particularly busy month. For November, particularly Thanksgiving, the department is asking everyone to be aware of kitchen/cooking dangers. Don't leave stoves and ovens unattended and make sure your smoke detectors are functional.

He also noted Captain Ronald Wilson's recent passing. The new captain is Captain Maurice Bird, who may only be in the position temporarily. Discussion ensued regarding support services available to first responders to help them deal with job-related stress and health issues.

III. 2020 Budget Process Update

President Hawse reported on recent discussions regarding planning for the 2020 budget. The first budget meeting took place on October 28th and focused on reviewing this year's budget. The next meeting, November 25th, will focus on coming up with ideas and proposals for the 2020 budget. All Trustees are invited to attend, and to submit proposals in writing if they cannot make it.

IV. Treasurer's Report

Treasurer Goose reported on CTM's budget and financial performance. The change over to Superior Credit Union is complete. CANS PTO now has its 501(c)(3) status so there will no longer be any revenue for that item. Revenue and expenses are as expected. Regarding the balance sheet, the major reduction in assets came from writing off the Clifton Market loan following the completion of the sale to Mr. Singh. Otherwise assets and liabilities are as expected. Copies of the monthly statement and budget sheet are attached.

Discussion ensued regarding the appropriate characterization of the Clifton Market loan and the appropriateness of expenditures for the Ludlow Avenue parklet trial. Trustee Maney moved to accept the reports. Trustee Duffy seconded the motion. A vote was taken and the motion passed with one abstention.

Following the vote, discussion ensued regarding candidates to serve as Treasurer next year. No action was taken.

V. Ludlow and Ormond Crosswalk

Vice President Borders gave an update on CTM's and CBA's efforts to install a crosswalk at the corner of Ludlow and Ormond. CBA has been trying to get this crosswalk installed for years but there were never funds available. However recently Councilmember David Mann's chief of staff informed CBA that funds were available. The cost of the crosswalk is approximately \$25,000, which includes curb-cutting, moving lampposts and telephone wires, moving parking meters, and moving Ace Hardware's truck loading zone. This estimate is more than Councilmember Mann's office estimated, so the office asked the community to chip in. They are asking for \$10,000 in community support. CBA is contributing \$5,000, and Vice President Borders asking CTM to contribute the other \$5,000.

Vice President Borders acknowledged that there have been recent discussions regarding safety and crosswalk lighting. He reported that his understanding is that this crosswalk will have a pedestrian crossing placard in the middle of the street. Regarding lighting, it is not installed automatically and there is a process that we would have to go through to request that. This is the second request for this unbudgeted expense, so Vice President Borders moved to have CTM contribute \$5,000 to the crosswalk expense. Trustee Metzger seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued among the Trustees and community members in attendance. When asked whether CBA would cover the entire cost, Vice President Borders noted it was very important to CBA for CTM to share this cost. CBA feels it has borne a majority of costs for the Plaza, flowerpots, and other expenses, and wants CTM to be an equal partner on this issue. The business and property owners along Ludlow are aware of the proposal and like the idea of a crosswalk. Further discussion ensued regarding a DOT study indicating that unlighted crosswalks with no additional infrastructure may actually reduce pedestrian safety. The placard that will be placed in the middle of the road, and the potential for additional infrastructure, reduce these concerns. Regarding costs for installing lighting infrastructure, there is no estimate yet. However for a similar crossing in Northside, the City is covering the expense. There will be no ongoing maintenance costs. Further discussion ensued regarding the appropriate cost split between CTM and CBA, and whether this is a good use of CTM's reserve money.

Following discussion, a vote was taken. The motion passed unanimously.

VI. Off Ludlow Art Gallery Update

Committee chair Sean Mullaney gave an update on the Off Ludlow Art Gallery. There is a new holiday show opening soon, and the Gallery will also be open for Holidays on Ludlow. The See the Music show just closed and resulted in approximately \$1,000 in sales (with 20% going to CTM's Arts and Culture Committee). If anyone is interested in volunteering please contact Sean.

Regarding the murals, the Committee has reached an agreement with Ambar India regarding mural placement on the Ludlow Garage building. However there is still a chance that the agreement will fall through, so the Committee is scouting alternate locations. Discussion ensued regarding the process for reaching and details of the agreement, as well as the timetable for installing the murals.

VII. Park and Bench People Discussion

Vice President Borders reported that there will be a meeting Monday November 18th at the CRC to continue the discussion started last month regarding individual financial solicitation at and around the Shell station on Clifton Avenue and trying to find a neighborly way to help these individuals in need and address this issue. An email will go out to the community regarding the meeting.

VIII. Proposed Executive Committee Responsibilities Standing Rule

Trustee Montgomery gave an overview of the proposed standing rule, which assigns specific responsibilities to various Executive Committee positions. The proposed standing rule has been in discussion since January and has gone through many revisions. He then moved that CTM adopt the proposed standing rule. Trustee Marsh seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued regarding the drafting process and need for the standing rule. Following discussion, a vote was taken. The motion passed with one abstention. A copy of the standing rule as passed is attached.

IX. Membership Committee Update

Trustee Marsh gave an update on the Membership Committee's recent activities and membership statistics. Membership numbers are slightly ahead of last year, and the Committee anticipates further memberships at the December meeting. The membership coupons in the Chronicle also help drive membership. Trustee Marsh also asked the Trustees to try and make personal appeals to neighbors to join. The Membership Committee will also support the Nominating Committee at the December election.

Trustee Marsh moved to accept the Membership Committee's report. Trustee Gilbreath seconded the motion. Discussion ensued regarding plans for the December election and whether the membership coupons are actually included in the Chronicle. Further discussion ensued regarding how to increase membership numbers, including a year of free membership in exchange for filling out a survey or participating in CTM activities or working with the business community to incentivize membership. The Trustees and community members in attendance also discussed historic membership numbers and trends in community engagement and contested elections. Following discussion, a vote was taken. The motion to accept the Membership Committee's report passed unanimously.

X. Ad Hoc Document Protection Committee

Secretary Brunner gave an overview of the ad hoc committee's discussions and proposal regarding how to secure and protect the documents located on CTM's Drive account. The ad hoc committee proposes 1) creating a new Drive account that will be owned by a CTM Gmail account instead of an individual Trustee; 2) creating a backup copy of the existing Drive account; and then 3) transferring the backup copy to the new account. This will make the CTM account the owner of the Drive account, its folders and subfolders, and all documents, which should address the issue of having individual owners of documents being able to delete them.

Secretary Brunner moved to adopt the recommendation and authorize transfer of the Drive account documents. Trustee Montgomery seconded the motion. Discussion ensued among the Trustees regarding whether there was actually a risk to the documents in the existing Drive account and whether there were more limited approaches available. Following the discussion, Trustee Metzger moved to table the issue to permit further investigation. Secretary Brunner seconded the motion. The motion to table passed unanimously.

XI. Nominating Committee Report

Vice President Borders gave an update and overview of the Trustee nomination process and the upcoming election. Candidate bios will be included in the upcoming Chronicle. Elections will take place next month before the December meeting, from 6-7. There are currently seven candidates (two incumbents and five new candidates) for seven positions.

XII. Proposed Zoning Variance Request Standing Rule

Trustee Marsh gave an overview of the rationale for the proposed rule, including prior missed opportunities for the Board to have input on zoning variance issues. The proposed standing rule will require Board notification of all zoning variance hearings. Trustee Marsh moved that the Board adopt the proposed standing rule. Trustee Metzger seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued among the Trustees regarding the requirement that the Housing and Zoning Committee provide a “recommendation,” the process by which CTM is notified of zoning issues, and the frequency of zoning variance issues. Further discussion ensued regarding the procedure for reviewing proposed standing rules and whether an alternative would be for President Hawse to forward all initial variance communications to the Board in addition to the Housing and Zoning Committee.

Following discussion, Trustee Hamberg moved to table the motion to adopt for further review of the proposed standing rule. Trustee Maney seconded the motion. Following further discussion regarding the Housing and Zoning Committee’s opportunity to review the proposed standing rule, a vote was taken. The motion passed unanimously.

XIII. Ludlow Avenue Rush Hour Parking Restrictions

Trustee Marsh noted that there is a requirement for monthly updates regarding the ongoing Ludlow Avenue rush hour parking trial. Trustee Montgomery reported that there have been no noted complaints or problems, and that several police officers have reiterated that they have heard no complaints. The trial is nearing its midway point. Trustee Montgomery asked anyone with a comment or question to contact him. Trustee Block suggested having a more substantive update at the December meeting, and Vice President Borders noted that CBA is also soliciting feedback that he will try to report at the December meeting.

XIV. Clifton Plaza Update

President Hawse gave an update on the Clifton Plaza redesign efforts. DAAP students are working on the proposals and hope to be able to present approximately five options soon.

XV. Golf Outing Report

Treasurer Goose reported on the financial numbers from the 2019 Golf Outing. This was the highest amount the Golf Outing ever raised, with income of approximately \$15,000 and expenses of approximately \$5,000. Further discussion ensued regarding the amount donated to the Little Sisters of the Poor and whether the event as a whole makes CTM money or costs CTM money. Treasurer Goose will get the full numbers and report during the December meeting.

XVI. December Agenda Discussion

President Hawse led a discussion regarding planning the December agenda, including reports from Committees. Discussion ensued among the Trustees and community members in attendance regarding how to drive community engagement during the meeting, including a visual presentation of what CTM has done or intends to do, or breaking into small listening groups to ask what the community wants most out of CTM. 30 minutes will be devoted to this topic at the December meeting. Additionally, NSP funding has to be on the agenda and President Hawse indicated he will move to spend the NSP funds on the Ludlow bench project (which emerged from prior community engagement sessions). Trustee Montgomery also suggested putting the community plan topic on the December agenda.

Following discussion, President Hawse moved that the Board propose to the community that the NSP funds be spent on the benches project. Vice President Borders seconded the motion. A vote was taken, and the motion passed with two abstentions.

XVII. Trustee Announcements

Trustee Hamberg reported that he is working with CUF representatives on exploring a potential "Taste of Uptown" restaurant event.

Trustee Metzger reported that the written Chronicle is at the printer, and that the Lantern Walk is this Sunday.

Trustee Marsh asked what is the status of decorating Ludlow Avenue for the holidays. Treasurer Goose said he will contact Adam Balz.

XVIII. Community Questions

A community member in attendance reported that the census is upcoming and there is a need for census takers. Temporary positions are available for \$19/hr., 15-40 hours per week, to work on reaching out to individuals in the community who don't respond to the written census questions. Anyone interested can apply online at 2020census.gov/jobs.

XIX. Adjournment/Next Meeting

The meeting was adjourned at 9:00 p.m. The next scheduled CTM meeting is at 7 p.m., Monday December 2, 2019 at the Clifton Recreation Center.

Respectfully submitted by Joe Brunner, CTM Secretary.

Clifton Town Meeting

BALANCE SHEET

As of September 30, 2019

	SEP 2019		
	CURRENT	AS OF AUG 31, 2019 (PP)	% CHANGE
ASSETS			
Current Assets			
Bank Accounts			
Cash on Hand	300.00	300.00	0.00 %
Cert of Deposit 33	14,410.78	14,219.26	1.35 %
Cert of Deposit 91	39,453.71	38,996.97	1.17 %
Checking	23,779.96	27,500.24	-13.53 %
Arts and Culture Account	679.19	3,729.19	-81.79 %
CANS PTO	3,762.81	2,975.81	26.45 %
Total Checking	28,221.96	34,205.24	-17.49 %
PayPal Bank	878.27	878.27	0.00 %
Prepaid Postage	222.19	222.19	0.00 %
Total Bank Accounts	\$83,486.91	\$88,821.93	-6.01 %
Other Current Assets			
Clifton Market Loan	0.00	7,800.00	-100.00 %
Prepaid Expenditures	0.00	0.00	
Uncategorized Asset	0.00	200.00	-100.00 %
Undeposited Funds	0.00	0.00	
Total Other Current Assets	\$0.00	\$8,000.00	-100.00 %
Total Current Assets	\$83,486.91	\$96,821.93	-13.77 %
TOTAL ASSETS	\$83,486.91	\$96,821.93	-13.77 %
LIABILITIES AND EQUITY			
Liabilities			
Current Liabilities			
Other Current Liabilities			
Loan Write-off	-8,000.00		
Reimbursements Owed	0.00	0.00	
Total Other Current Liabilities	\$ -8,000.00	\$0.00	0.00%
Total Current Liabilities	\$ -8,000.00	\$0.00	0.00%
Total Liabilities	\$ -8,000.00	\$0.00	0.00%
Equity			
Opening Balance Equity	75,914.77	75,914.77	0.00 %
Retained Earnings	8,463.46	8,463.46	0.00 %
Net Revenue	7,108.68	12,443.70	-42.87 %
Total Equity	\$91,486.91	\$96,821.93	-5.51 %
TOTAL LIABILITIES AND EQUITY	\$83,486.91	\$96,821.93	-13.77 %

Clifton Town Meeting

MONTHLY ACTIVITY

September 2019

	TOTAL	
	SEP 2019	AUG 2-31, 2019 (PP)
Revenue		
Donations		6.00
Event Income		
Golf Outing Income		8,035.00
Golf Outing Sponsorship		700.00
Uncategorized Event Income		1.00
Total Event Income		8,736.00
Grants		
Neighborhood Support Program		1,750.00
Restricted Grants		
CANS PTO Income	787.00	
Total Restricted Grants	787.00	
Total Grants	787.00	1,750.00
Interest	659.24	3.21
Memberships		34.00
Sponsorships	3,100.00	3,200.00
Total Revenue	\$4,546.24	\$13,729.21
GROSS PROFIT	\$4,546.24	\$13,729.21
Expenditures		
Administrative Expenses		144.90
Clifton Chronicle Expenses		2,397.61
Event Expenses		
CliftonFest Expenses	3,000.00	
Golf Outing Expenses		4,955.41
Memorial Day Expenses		103.96
Total Event Expenses	3,000.00	5,059.37
Insurance		191.00
Off Ludlow Gallery Expenses	1,200.00	121.68
Special Projects	1,068.86	
Murals and Artwork	4,600.00	-4,200.00
Walking Route - NSP		5,000.00
Total Special Projects	5,668.86	800.00
Transaction Fees		
PayPal Fees		8.22
Square Fees	12.40	153.71
Total Transaction Fees	12.40	161.93
Unapplied Cash Bill Payment Expenditure		0.00
Total Expenditures	\$9,881.26	\$8,876.49
NET OPERATING REVENUE	\$ -5,335.02	\$4,852.72
Other Expenditures		
Other Miscellaneous Expenditure		4,329.50

	TOTAL	
	SEP 2019	AUG 2-31, 2019 (PP)
Reconciliation Discrepancies		0.16
Total Other Expenditures	\$0.00	\$4,329.66
NET OTHER REVENUE	\$0.00	\$ -4,329.66
NET REVENUE	\$ -5,335.02	\$523.06

Clifton Town Meeting (CTM) Executive Committee Responsibilities Standing Rule

Adopted November 4, 2019

Purpose:

This Standing Rule assigns specific responsibilities, in concert with those existing in the CTM Bylaws, to be fulfilled by the Executive Committee under the direction of the President. The members of the Executive Committee may choose either to perform them or delegate to others.

Responsibilities of the Executive Committee

1. Inform Trustees and Committee Chairs of Their Duties
 - 1.1. Ensure that all Trustees and Committee Chairs are informed of their responsibilities under the Bylaws, Standing Rules, and practices of CTM.
 - 1.2. Plan the Trustee Training / Onboarding Session prior to the first meeting of the new year, including organizing the program and content, sending pre-reading material, and scheduling a time acceptable to most incoming, continuing, and outgoing Trustees.
 - 1.3. Provide all Trustees with the Conflict of Interest Compliance Statement, which they must sign at the beginning of each year of their terms before being allowed to vote.
2. CTM Board Meetings
 - 2.1. At the first Board meeting of the year, pass a motion that establishes the regular Board meeting dates for the remainder of the year and including the first meeting the following January.
 - 2.2. Publicize all Board meetings by official and other customary means, such as Clifton Community website calendar, first page of Clifton Community website, Clifton News email list, all active CTM social media channels; and to post timely reminders of each meeting on Clifton News email list and social media, and other channels as appropriate.

Clifton Town Meeting (CTM) Executive Committee Responsibilities Standing Rule

- 2.3. Utilize the following standard meeting announcement text, which may be adjusted to reflect changes such as day, time, location, procedure, and agenda:

Clifton Town Meeting (CTM) is your neighborhood community council, recognized by the City of Cincinnati and representing residents of Clifton. Board of Trustees meetings are open to the public and are usually held at 7:00 PM on the first Monday of each month at the Clifton Recreation Center, 320 McAlpin (free parking, universally accessible).

CTM welcomes your interest and participation in community affairs. The Trustees value your thoughts on agenda items or other concerns. You may speak during Board discussion of most agenda items and raise other concerns during the Public Comment time. The time allotted for individual comments and topics, and the number of speakers, may be limited in order to accommodate a fair representation of views. Those who sign up before the meeting will be given preference to speak. The Board customarily refers new concerns to one of its committees for recommendation. If your issue is urgent, email contactctm@cliftoncommunity.org right away. You can also ask to put an item on the agenda for the next meeting or tell the Board your opinion about any community concern.

- 2.4. Prepare, circulate, and retain an attendance sheet for each CTM Meeting, whenever a record of attendance is required (e.g., Neighborhood Support Program).
- 2.5. Request Trustees to email resolutions, reports, and presentations to the Board at least three days ahead for consideration at a Board Meeting, and to remind them to send them immediately after the Meeting if they have changed or not been received, for inclusion by the Secretary in the minutes.
- 2.6. Send draft minutes to the Board for corrections within one week. Include any presentations as addendums at end.
- 2.7. Disseminate approved minutes on Cliftoncommunity.org and/or other official channels.

3. Executive Committee Meetings

- 3.1. Hold an Executive Committee meeting one week before each Board meeting for the purpose of setting the agenda:
- 3.2. Remind Trustees and Committee Chairpersons one week before the Executive Committee meeting to request time and submit motions as appropriate for their agenda items.
- 3.3. Publicize an invitation to submit agenda items in the same manner as Board meetings are publicized (above)
- 3.4. Choose from a list of items for consideration including input from
 - 3.4.1. Trustees and Committees
 - 3.4.2. Communications from CTM members, the public, and others
 - 3.4.3. Upcoming deadlines and calendar items that need to be planned for
 - 3.4.4. Unfinished business from prior meetings
 - 3.4.5. Reports due from committees, etc.
 - 3.4.6. Ensure that decisions made by the Executive Committee are on the agenda
- 3.5. Send draft of Executive Committee minutes to Executive Committee for corrections in time for the approved agenda to be publicized.
- 3.6. Publicize the meeting agenda to all communication channels (noted above) by Friday before the CTM meeting.

4. Communications: The Executive Committee shall oversee the communications between the Board and the community, including:

- 4.1. Operations according to Website / Social Media Committee Responsibilities and Security Guidelines
- 4.2. Clifton News email (currently Mail Chimp) providing the ability to send:
 - 4.2.1. Information about the official actions of the Board and its committees;
 - 4.2.2. Information related to the ongoing concerns of the Board;
 - 4.2.3. General information about the community, its businesses, and institutions;

- 4.2.4. Advertisement of Clifton Town Meeting events, events in which CTM plays a financial or volunteer role, community events and events sponsored by community businesses and institutions;
- 4.3. Links to additional information on other CTM media outlets;
- 4.4. Email content shall not take a position of support or opposition towards political candidates;
- 4.5. Email content shall not take a position on any issue for which CTM has not taken a formal position;
- 4.6. Maintain and promote the Clifton News subscriber list including investigating all reports of spam.
- 4.7. Obtain content for emails from other organizations, CTM Committees, and Trustees.
- 4.8. Respond to and forward inbound emails received via contactctm@cliftoncommunity.org to appropriate people on the board or to a full Committee. Best practice is to have two people monitor this inbox. Update the email forwarder on godaddy.com so that the two selected people get the emails.
- 4.9. Update the city wide Community Council director on contact information changes by going to this link and following appropriate instructions from Invest In Neighborhoods. <https://portal.investinneighborhoods.org/community-council-information-change/>
- 4.10. Coordinate checking the USPS mail. There are two keys. Open and review all USPS mail. Distribute USPS mail as soon as possible and depending on priority.
- 4.11. Send official communications of CTM actions (primarily resolutions) to the City Council, Mayor, City Manager, and/or appropriate City department director.

5. Maintain Trustee File and Email Access

- 5.1. Update Google Group for CTM Board when Trustees join and depart. This is an “opt in” private email group for internal communications only. Send invite to new Trustees.
- 5.2. Update Google Drive access for CTM Board when Trustees join and depart.

Clifton Town Meeting (CTM) Executive Committee Responsibilities Standing Rule

- 5.2.1. Maintain access for Trustees by adjusting emails for new and departing Trustees as well as non-Trustee Committee members.
- 5.2.2. Remind Trustees to keep files updated. This updating is not the specific job of the Secretary or any other Officer.
- 5.2.3. Remind Committees to read the files for prior years' work efforts so they don't have to reinvent each year. Committees should also update files with new learnings and ideas from the current year.
- 5.3. At godaddy.com, setup who gets forwarded the various CTM email accounts: (currently) housingandzoning, CTMpresident, CTMtreasurer, CTMwebmaster, membership, CTMgolfouting.

Trustees,

In advance of tomorrow's Board meeting, please find an update regarding our membership rolls:

Current membership status (which I will forward to the Board shortly tonight):
\$1722 dues paid including 3 new lifetime members
\$254 donations
\$1976 total collected
151 active members.

We have already exceeded the prior year collections which were \$1250 dues plus \$144 donations for a total of \$1394. However, we need more members to renew.

*** Note that numbers above are not necessarily tied perfectly to the Treasurer's report. I'm referring to what we show on the membership roster, and of course, the Treasurer's report is the final word on dues and donations collected through the membership process

As a reminder, many members renew at the election event. Some current Trustees have not renewed their membership this year. The membership process at meetings has generated lots of renewals so this new idea has worked well. Clifton Chronicle coupons continue to also be a well used method.

What could you do to help? Your neighbors and friends could use another reminder that we would enjoy their membership. Your personal touch may be the motivation that moves them to renew. We collect membership dues in arrears all year long with no late fees. Refer people to this link: <http://www.cliftoncommunity.org/2019-membership-drive/>

What's next for the Membership Committee? We will send some more reminder emails, do training of committee members on how to maintain the rolls, and send a mailing out to all who have not yet responded. Finally, we will be prepared to support the Nominating Committee during election night.

Thanks and regards,
Kevin