



**CTM Board Meeting Minutes
January 6, 2020
Clifton Recreation Center**

Present: Peter Block, Pat Borders, Joe Brunner, Jan Brown Checco, Gerald Checco, Brian Duffy, Buddy Goose, Robert Hamberg, Catherine Hamilton Hicks, Mark Jeffreys, Rama Kasturi, Jennifer Krivickas, Vince Metzger, Malcolm Montgomery, Ioanna Paraskevopolous

Absent:

A quorum is present. Meeting called to order at 7:02 pm by Vice President Patrick Borders

I. December's Meeting Minutes

Secretary Joe Brunner moved to adopt the minutes of the December Board meeting. Vice President Borders seconded the motion. A vote was taken. The motion passed unanimously.

II. Police and Fire Reports

A. *Police* Officer Nick Hageman reported on crime statistics over the past month. Details: 91% decrease in the past month, down 42% for the year for burgleries. Police were proactive during the holiday season, successfully, with a holiday task force of additional officers on the ground from Thanksgiving until New Years. 3% increase overall the past year for all crimes combined, but the overall report makes Clifton one of the safest neighborhoods in the city. The full STARS and other reports can be found at <http://cincinnati-ohio.gov/police/crime-analysis>.

B. *Fire* DOUG BAKER from Engine 34 reported on the station's recent activities. Data in their system was lost this past month. There was an uptick in fires throughout the city, especially 2 alarm fires. Wintertime checking of hydrants will be ongoing, every hydrant checked every two weeks. He explained that if any fire equipment is ever out of service, stations rotate and share equipment so there will be no gaps in services. A new Captain will be named soon. Fire and Water Works are going to be cooperating to update records of hydrant efficiencies.

III. Officer Elections

Note: **(U)** signifies 14 for and 0 against

FOR PRESIDENT – JOE BRUNNER (U) President Brunner thanked Brad Hawse for his leadership and also outgoing Board members Joyce Rich, Kevin Marsh, Stephanie Gilbreath and Seth Maney for their past service.

TWO VPs: 3 CANDIDATES - Buddy Goose, Robert Hamberg and Rama Kasturi - were introduced, each offered a statement followed by a paper vote by the Board.

VP RESULTS: 1st VP ROBERT HAMBERG, 2nd VP BUDDY GOOSE

SECRETARY: JAN CHECCO (U)

TREASURER: GERALD CHECCO (U)

IV. Committee Chair Elections – Discussion and Vote to Create and/or disband committees

ALL CHAIRS appointed with no contest. (U)

ARTS AND CULTURE - SEAN MULLANEY; BEAUTIFICATION – CATHERINE HAMILTON HICKS; BUSINESS DISTRICT – PATRICK BORDERS; CLIFTON CHRONICLE – RAMA KASTURI AND VINCE METZGER; CLIFTON COMMUNITY LLC – JOE BRUNNER AND GERALD CHECCO; EDUCATION – VINCE METZGER; HOUSING AND ZONING - MALCOLM MONTGOMERY; MEMBERSHIP - MARK JEFFREYS AND IOANNA PARASKEVOPOLOUS; NOMINATING - RAMA KASTURI; PARKS - MARK JEFFREYS; TRANSPORTATION – MARK JEFFREYS; MEDIA - IOANNA PARASKEVOPOLOUS

AD HOC CHAIRS:

President Brunner moved: “BYLAWS” be changed in title to **“GOVERNANCE”** and become a **Standing Committee**. Seconded by **Trustee Montgomery**, who has volunteered to **Chair. (U)**

FUNDRAISING – JOE BRUNNER (U)

SUPPORT CCAC – MALCOLM MONTGOMERY (U)

“WALKING ROUTES” – the work is finished, a move to disband this committee by President Brunner, second by VP Goose. **(U)**

NEW AD HOC COMMITTEE “STRATEGIC PLANNING”– Trustee Jeffreys presented the topic, volunteered to **Chair with Robert Hamberg assisting**. Trustee Jeffreys moved for creation of the committee, Trustee Hamberg seconds. **(U)**

NEIGHBORHOOD COMMUNITY PLAN – This is a once-in-30-years opportunity, and all are called to participate and support the work. **President Brunner moves to create an AD HOC COMMITTEE and volunteers to Chair** it with Brad Hawse supporting him. Trustee Hamberg seconds. The planning to be undertaken is specific to Clifton, and any plans developed must be approved at City level. Trustee Krivikas suggests invitation of experts from University of Cincinnati to work sessions, Trustee Block requests that John Osterman also be invited. Trustee Jeffreys suggests that the work progress through the year, with inclusion of the community at large. **VOTE to create this Ad Hoc Committee: (13 FOR, 1 ABS)**

V. Liaison Elections (U)

CBA – JAN CHECCO

CCF – PATRICK BORDERS

INVEST – IOANNA PARASKEVOPOLOUS

TRIHEALTH – CATHERINE HAMILTON HICKS

UC – JENNIFER KRIVIKAS

UPTOWN – JENNIFER KRIVIKAS

VI. Event Captain Elections (U)

CLIFTONFEST – PATRICK BORDERS

GOLF – ERIC URBAS, JOHN WHEATON (not in attendance this evening, but will be contacted))

CLIFTON HOUSE TOUR – PATRICK BORDERS

MEMORIAL DAY – BUDDY GOOSE

LANTERN WALK – VINCE METZGER

Note: HOLIDAYS ON LUDLOW will be produced by Clifton Business Association in 2020

VII. Discussion and Vote on 2020 Meeting Dates

Suggested schedule: First Monday monthly, July 6 included. September 7 is Labor Day, so meeting will be held on September 14. VP Goose points out that because Mondays fall early in the months this year, banking activity may cause Treasurer's reports to lag by a month. President Brunner moves to adopt the dates, Trustee Montgomery seconds **(U)** *A copy of the meeting dates is attached.*

VIII. Discussion and Vote on 2020 Budget

Treasurer Goose reminds the Board that the proposed budget has been discussed and updated in prior meetings, and President Brunner suggests that the budget can be adopted now, and adapted throughout the year as needed. *(Budget document is attached.)* Removal of the the Flower Pots line item is due to Clifton Business Association picking up that cost. The Arts and Culture total of \$4000 will be split between the mural and gallery projects. Regarding the parklet line item, Trustee Goose noted that the projected 2020 expenses reflect a longer anticipated operational time, as well as the fact that CTM will cover costs in 2020 while CBA covered costs in 2019. Discussion ensued among the Trustees regarding which committee is responsible for the parklet project, the amount and need for the budgeted expense, the merits of the parklet project, whether more community feedback and engagement is necessary, and how to move the project forward.

Following the discussion, **Trustee Block moved** to condition any expenditure of the allotted funds on further Board approval. **Treasurer Checco seconded** the motion. Further discussion ensued. **Trustee Jeffreys then moved** to require the Business Committee to solicit further community input on the parklet project and report back to the Board, and that no funds be expended until further Board approval. **Vice President Hamberg seconded** the motion. Further discussion ensued among the Trustees regarding the merits of removing the parklet line item

and instead reallocating the funds into a special projects line item. **Trustees Block and Jeffreys withdrew their motions.**

Following further discussion, **Vice President Hamberg moved** to 1) delete the two parklet line items and instead create a Special Project fund line item and allocate \$10,000 to it; and 2) require the Business District Committee to solicit and gather community feedback on the parklet project and plans for the future, and require the Business District Committee to report its findings to the Board before any expenditures from the Special Projects fund. **Trustee Borders seconded** the motion. A vote was taken, and the **motion passed unanimously (U).**

Treasurer Goose remarks that the 2019 Chronicle budget will be balanced, Memorial Day event will break even, and that the Cliftonfest event aims to be more profitable in 2020. Trustee Hamberg inquired about any estate gifts we currently receive, the answer is that there are none. He suggests that seeking same become part of the Fundraising Committee's work. It is suggested that soliciting support from trusts and charitable funds as well as advice from Uptown Cincinnati also be added. **Treasurer Checco moved** that the 2020 Budget be accepted as revised, **Trustee Borders seconded (U)** Treasurer Checco reminds everyone to use the CTM Form when submitting any expenses to the Board.

IX. Presentation and Discussion on Request for Zoning Relief for 3767 Clifton Avenue

Trustee Montgomery shared via email City project documents (*attached to these minutes*). He noted CTM did not receive access to the City ProjectDox files until two hours before tonight's Board Meeting, and that neither H&Z nor Trustees had time to review them or the commentary he also sent. The applicant had contacted the nearest neighbors and obtained their consent to the renovation. H&Z Committee was generally supportive with reservations. It would create a second principle residence on a lot zoned for single-family, which is generally prohibited by law. There is an exception under certain specific conditions: if the building is historically significant and has been occupied recently (within past 365 days), it may be "grandfathered" and allowed. The applicant described the outbuilding as a "carriage house" that had been used as a residence and sought approval under the grandfather provision. H&Z had questioned the applicability of this exception but lacked the technical knowledge to confirm it. The applicant had told H&Z they would execute a covenant to prohibit future subdivision but declined to produce the document they proposed or the basis for the historic claim. Because the City Staff Report included provisions that satisfied most concerns raised in the H&Z Committee, Trustee Montgomery recommended supporting it.

The owners' architect, Tim Jeckering, suggested that a historic carriage house would have to be demolished if the owners were not permitted to renovate it; that they intended to use it only for a nanny or eventual residence for aging parents and not as a rental property. He added that the owners were academics who expected to travel from time to time to take temporary extended positions out of town and would want to be able to rent to people who were neither family nor employees.

Trustee Montgomery noted that there wasn't enough time in the meeting to present the City Staff Report, in which the Urban Conservator found the so-called carriage house was in fact a garage build c. 1925, not found to be a contributing factor to the main residence (which was historically significant), and had not been occupied for decades. As such, it did not meet the

requirements for the grandfather exception. However, the City Staff agreed to recommend approval if the owner would include a covenant prohibiting subdivision and allowing rental of the second residence only to family and employees, or in the sabbatical scenario, to the same party renting the main house. In other words, the City would grant an exception allowing the renovation of a non-historical, non-grandfathered second residence on the single-family lot if the applicant would agree to use it only for the three purposes put forth in the application.

Mr. Jeckering maintained it would be unfair not to allow the owners the same right as others in the neighborhood who also had renovated historic carriage houses and rented them out. He said the owners were willing to agree to a covenant against subdividing, but not rental restrictions. They did not want to rent it out as an Airbnb but would want to rent it to visiting scholars when they were away for a year.

VP Goose asks if, prior to the recent vacancy of 365+ days of the structure (expiration of a prior rentable condition in a period when renovation could not be undertaken), could this structure have been rented? Trustee Paraskevopolous asked if the Staff's decision is conformed to the City's short term rental ordinance? Trustee Montgomery suggested that, if rental were not constrained to only family or house staff, rental to others would create a defacto second residence on the Single Family property. He also suggested that this decision has potential for creation of a precedent for second residences being established on Single Family properties with garages. He asked whether Trustees felt they understood the City Staff Report recommendation which he believed satisfied the owners' needs as expressed in their application.

AFTER MUCH DISCUSSION AMONG BOARD MEMBERS -

Trustee Montgomery moved that H&Z Committee and CTM Board have no objection to the City Staff's position concerning the renovation project. **There was no second to this motion.**

Treasurer Checco moved that the Board not object to the first covenant for no division of the property to make a second lot, but that we do not support the non-rental covenant since this is a historic property and should not be forced into demolition or subdivision if the owners cannot exercise rights of rental. Trustee Block seconds. **VOTE: 13 FOR, 1 AGAINST. MOTION PASSES.**

XII. Trustee Announcements/Updates from Liaisons

Trustee Metzger reminded the community that a new format of Clifton Chronicle is coming out for Spring 2020, and solicited creation of articles for the publication.

Trustee Block advised that the Arts and Culture Committee is considering a plan for a fundraiser at Postmark, and the Board generally encouraged this idea. The Off Ludlow Gallery had over \$7000 in sales with their Holiday Boutique Exhibition. That committee keeps 25% of all sales, and the commission donations from exhibiting artists are used to defray project costs and included in the committee budget.

Trustee Duffy reports that the CTM website is broken, and asked if a professional should be hired to fix it? Discussion will continue at the next meeting.

XIII. Community Questions/Concerns

Trustee Duffy relayed requests from the community for updating of the CTM website.

Cynthia Duval announced that some road closure in Burnet Woods is under discussion, as well as trails safety. Emergency Vehicle egress is another topic of concern.

Daniel Ames inquired about the operational status of the Clifton School Clock. Trustee Metzger and Arts and Culture Chair Mullaney intend to look at the clock problem with CPS Facilities Staff.

CANDIDATE COMMENT: FANONRUCKER.COM encouraged everyone to visit his website.

XIV. Adjournment/Next Meeting - MOVED Trustee Borders, **SECONDED** Trustee Metzger

The meeting was adjourned at 8:58 p.m. The next scheduled CTM meeting is at 7 p.m., Monday February 3, 2020 at the Clifton Recreation Center.

Respectfully submitted by Jan Brown Checco, CTM Secretary

Attachments:

CTM Meeting Schedule

CTM 2020 Budget

Housing and Zoning Committee documents for 3767 Clifton Avenue renovation project